

A Mennonite Musicological Shift?

Hannah Wallis^{1*}

¹Ph.D Research Scholar, Department of Theology, Philosophy and Religious Studies, Liverpool Hope University, England, UK.

*Corresponding Author: hannahwallis17@gmail.com

Doi: <https://doi.org/10.26524/ijdst.2.2>

Abstract

In 1537, 60 Anabaptists were imprisoned in the Oberhaus castle dungeons. Their crime, a nonacceptance of the state religion, and through their confinement, hymns were created and sang forming the centrality of what would become the Anabaptist hymnary. 486 years later, more than 100 people attended a conference exploring Mennonite music. This article examines 10 churches from across the denomination(s), considering the musical pieces that appear most frequently, and the question concerning the Biblical usage of musical instruments, and how they have been understood and adopted.

Keywords: *A Cappella, Anabaptism, Anhang, Ausbund, Congregational Singing, Contemporary Christian Music (CCM), Evangeliums-Lieder, Gesangbuch, Gospel Music, Heart Songs, Hymnal, Hymnody, Mennonite, Musical Repertoire, Voices Together.*

1. Introduction

Music has always played an important part in the Anabaptist and later Mennonite identity as it evolved, and congregational singing gave a vital way of transmitting their theology, traditions, community focus, and personal experiences. From the beginning of Anabaptism in terms of hymnal tradition(s) found in the *Ausbund*, to more contemporary hymnals like *Voices Together*, [1]. The hymnals of the Mennonite Church have been in a perpetual state of development in the face of variable and changeable theological, cultural, and social contexts in which they found themselves. The extensive history of Mennonitism, and of its musicology shows the importance of congregational singing within services, but additionally the continuing questions about which songs are considered “correct” for inclusion, who decides which hymns should be included and what these hymn choices reflect of a Mennonite identity [2]. This study examined the musical choices of ten Mennonite churches, examining the repertoire used within worship, alongside the presence of lack of concerning instruments. 1,538 online services were analysed, ranging from 2020 to 2023 which was the publication year of *Voices Together* [3]. The study demonstrates the frequency of singing individual pieces, and if they were sung with instruments or a cappella. This paper also compares and contrasts contemporaneous findings with the last historical study in 1990 concerning

Mennonite Brethren congregations, to identify any change in hymnal preference(s) over time. Alongside a majoritively quantitative consideration, this research considers historical and theological questions that have contributed to varying Mennonite approaches to music. Attention is paid to the importance and continued presence of four-part a cappella singing, the changed acceptance of instrument use within worship, the developing use of contemporary Christian music, and the role hymnals have, either individually, or as a corpus, to preserve or change a Mennonite identity through music. This study’s findings posit that Mennonite musicology, and musical praxis is not stagnant or similar across the denominations. Rather, it highlights the varying amounts of theology and praxis suggest that Mennonite musical practice is neither static nor uniform. Rather, it reflects the diversity of congregations, whilst continuing to remain linked with the traditional congregational a cappella hymn singing. This article suggests that a Mennonite musical identity, if there indeed is one, should be seen as combining tradition from forefathers and practice(s) they may engage in as part of the global Christian Church. Transitioning developmentally from historical hymnals to *Voices Together* shows how the communities endure both continuity and developments, and the resulting repertoire seen from across the ten

churches suggests a richer musical identity. Simultaneously however, the continual repetition of particular songs, alongside the emerging of more contemporary songs becoming “heart songs” shows the continuing importance of memory and communal values within Mennonite worship.

2. Methodology

This article conducts a quantitative and qualitative study of the frequency and instrumental status of hymns and songs in 10 Mennonite churches across the denomination. I considered the music of Fairview Mennonite Church, Franconia Mennonite Church, Harrisonburg Mennonite Church, Hartville Conservative Mennonite Church, Journey Mennonite Church, Plains Mennonite Church, Parkview Mennonite Church, Salford Mennonite Church, Steinmann Mennonite Church, and finally Trinity Mennonite Church. For the purposes of this research, I consider any song or hymn sung four times or more in a particular church as a popular piece. I examined every service-totalling 1,538, from the time of the Coronavirus world lockdowns in 2020 to the end of 2023, to consider a wide variety of hymns but there were limitations. I was purely restricted to online services, which limited the scope of music I could access, and combined with the sometimes-poor audio quality when churches were learning how to work online, sometimes discerning the name of the hymn was difficult. Additionally, some churches-namely Franconia, Journey, Steinmann and Trinity did not start streaming till 2022, limiting the number of services that could be studied. Nevertheless, the results created the question whether the Mennonite repertoire is as big as expected, even with the arrival of the new Voices Together hymnal in 2020. The process of collating the information was as follows. Once I had devised a spreadsheet for each church with the name and frequency of each piece, I noted if it was sung a capella or accompanied, and if accompanied, which instrument(s) were being used. Then, I examined the spreadsheet as a whole, creating individual tables for each church, with any piece(s) that occurred five times or more inputted in descending order. I then created an additional table, where I listed any pieces that were sung four times or less, but were also common to five or more other churches. Finally, I created a table comparing the change(s) in frequency between 1990 and 2021-2023 of the hymns apparent in my own research. However, before the hymnal studies can take place, the musical lives of the Anabaptists must be considered.

3. Hymnal History

The Anabaptists had rich musical lives, with four-part a cappella hymn singing playing a central part in this lasting legacy-best evidenced by 45 different hymnals published from 1847-2020. However, the same question dogs each new resource: ‘...why do we sing what we sing? Who gets to choose? Who influences the choosers [4]. Further, how often do you need a new hymnal? ‘Every 25 years? Every century? Once for all time? Or are hymnals obsolete [5]. Anabaptist, and most early Protestant hymnals, lacked notation; opting instead to print the name of the tune that was to be sung before the name of the hymn. This meant that tunes were sung majoritively from memory, with very few exceptions. The tradition of learning tunes by memory could suggest that when a church is adopting a new hymnal, it may be quite an emotional process, potentially causing arguments during formulation due to the want of tradition adherence. Thiessen explains these conflicts through Johann Peter Claszen’s hymnological lens. Arguing uncompromisingly for a particular German hymnal style, Claszen wanted to revive Anabaptist songs for congregational worship. However, ‘...that could only be of interest to the Mennonites. He also wanted to awaken interest in the hymns outside the Mennonite community...’ [6]. But these would be subject to intense scrutiny. Hierarchies (Gupta, 2000). The marriage in 2 States is best understood as a modest extension of acceptable boundaries within an elite Hindu framework rather than as a radical disruption of caste as a structuring principle of Indian society. David Schulz, however, wanted four-part chorales and gospel hymns to be included, but Claszen had criticisms. He would happily have rid hymnals of all gospel hymns, detesting the emotionalism that he believed they brought. This strong stance would impact further disputes, such as with Benjamin Ewert, who argued for a united Mennonite hymnal across churches. However, another voice in the argument-Janzen-argued that the hymnal should only contain melodies, insisting that it should have ‘...no more than 300 hymns...’ [7]. Creating to a complex process of negotiation and compromise. In 1939, Claszen argued that Mennonite hymnals were littered with inaccuracies and ‘...distortions of the melodies and texts...’ [8]. He conceded that trying to bring a reformation and ‘union’ to Mennonite congregational singing would be difficult, so he distinguished between ‘...a Gemeinschaftsliederbuch and a Gesangbuch, maintaining that while songs of lower quality might be permitted in the former, only the best could be considered for inclusion in the latter [9]. Pauls states that for the Mennonites, singing is formative for a

community. It is ‘...personal, emotional, and memorable...’ [10]. As a result of these feelings, it may be argued that ‘kernlieder’ or ‘core songs’ should be used in hymnals. However, ironically, the Kernlieder were not considered the best, as they were too sentimental, and as Claszen argued, were less concerned with ‘...reality than illusion and fantasy so they do not belong in a German Protestant worship service [11]. Due to Claszen’s comments and influence, an extended period of arduous debate began, culminating in the production of the ‘...Gesangbuch der Mennoniten...’ of the Conference of Mennonites in Canada [12]. Throughout the 1940s, the Gesangbuch was supplemented with the Evangeliums-Lieder by the Conservative Mennonite Conference churches, and these two books became the primary hymnary resources for the Mennonite Brethren churches. Thirty percent of the contents of the Gesangbuch came from the Evangeliums-Lieder, which I argue was to maintain familiarity for congregations. Familiarity is important as it has shaped Anabaptist music from the beginning and continues to do so. As such, I argue that hymns and songs chosen for worship mirror congregational and individual experiences and beliefs, but I also maintain that the repertoire is affected by the oral transmission of songs. Therefore, I agree with Pauls that Mennonite music is additionally a ‘...reconciliation of theology, ethnic habits, individual narratives, and community dynamics’ [13]. When developing the Gesangbuch, many hymns were taken from the ‘...Gesangbuch ohne Noten...and the Gesangbuch mit Noten. The Mennonite Brethren hymnal set out to preserve and perpetuate the musical heritage...’ [14]. Looking to the past and the future when creating a new hymnal. Whilst the Gesangbuch and the Evangeliums-Lieder served the congregations throughout the 1940s and 1950s, a favouring of English emerged, and during the 1960s, the Mennonite Brethren Churches in Canada and the USA realised the need for a new hymnal to accommodate developing needs of both strands of the church. As a result, the Worship Hymnal was published in 1966, containing 678 songs with worship aids, but this was not without problems for Claszen. Despite the churches agreeing with this new hymnal, he still felt it had too many “modern” European standards. It fell far from his hope(s), but despite his numerous “issues,” its popularity prevailed and many hymnals came after. Hymnals are generational, reflecting questions and difficulties but also joys of a church. ‘The words and tunes of 30 years ago may not...fit the pastoral needs of today’s church [15]. Consequently, the Mennonite Church USA, the Mennonite Church Canada, and Mennonite Brethren churches use hymnals that are 20 plus years old, but

many conservative churches, such as Hartville, rely on the 2011 Hymns of the Church. This creates two questions. How easy is it to publish a hymnal that will be accepted majoritively; and if churches are singing out of older hymnals than 2011 onwards, what should be done with hymns from wayward believers? Graber states that in 2020, reports of David Haas’s abuse-emotionally, spiritually and sexually, were made to the charity ‘Into Account’. This was especially concerning since several of his songs appear in the ‘Sing the Journey’ and ‘Sing the Story-hymnals still used by Franconia, Plains and Salford. Whilst this may not be a problem, the main issue is that ‘...several that appear in Sing the Journey and Sing the Story...have become heart songs such as I will come to you in the silence...’ [16]. One must therefore ask when curating a new hymnal, whether it is “correct” to use these hymns? This question was particularly pertinent concerning gospel songs. Barg explains that these songs were relegated to the Anhang index of the ‘...1945 German Mennonite Hymnal...’ and were completely dismissed in the Mennonite Hymnal [17]. Two changes were the adoption of ‘...spiritual folk songs of the German Pietist movement...’ and popular music, characterised by the use of musical instruments, and it is to the validity of musical instruments that we shall now turn our attention [18].

4. Are Musical Instruments Biblical?

According to the Reformers, the Catholic Church was to be criticised for their use of musical instruments, as Christians have the ability to sing anywhere, musical instruments are not necessary. Slough explains that few Mennonites could detail ‘...why or how music helps them to praise, pray, or offer themselves to God’ [19]. This may have resulted from an affinity with the New Testament over the Old. The multitude of references to singing and instruments in temple worship is considered, but the reformers hold to their claim for a total lack of mention to instruments within the New Testament, claiming that only singing is commanded’ [20]. However, when considering the New Testament, the list of gifts mentioned should also be examined. No musical instruments are mentioned in any gifts in Ephesians 4:11; Romans 12:3-7, or 1 Corinthians 12:1-12, 28; corresponding with the over-arching Anabaptist ideal of not displaying pride in one’s musical abilities. Subsequently, if showing pride in musical talent is a sin, then it could be argued that Mennonite churches with worship bands could be sinning and distancing themselves from the original aim of the Reformers and early Anabaptism. Detailed performances were

considered not Biblical, which is something that Huldrych Zwingli tackled. He claimed that anything not in the New Testament should be rejected, as humans do not have the authority to make additions to Scripture. He quoted John 4:24 when he said that music should be in correlation to God's will, not the pleasures of man. Menno Simons agreed that there is no reference in Scripture to '...cloisters, chapels, organs, choral music, masses...' but under these thing the anti-Christian seductions and bloody abominations are readily perceived [21]. The banning of instruments was also backed by Martin Mohler and William Zepperus-two leading reformers, who agreed that they were part of an eradicated Jewish law, so why do churches feel the need to revive them? Charles Spurgeon also did not tolerate instruments for worship, speaking out about them more than once. He proclaimed that they are rejected and '...condemned by the whole army of Protestant divines by Zuinglius, Calvin, Peter Martyr, Zepperus, Paroeus, Willet, Ainsworth, Ames, Calderwood, and Cotton...' [22]. Both Fuller and Price also explain that musical instruments in worship were only prevalent in the 14th and 15th century Catholic Church, and the current generation. I suggest that Price is arguing for a development of anthropocentric worship within Mennonite churches, which could be interpreted as a loss of the fundamentally Christocentric nature of Anabaptism. Additionally, the use of instruments in worship could add to this human-centred worship-in direct opposition to the reformer's desire for the early church, as they saw the inevitable link '...between the use of musical instruments and the sensuality of false worship. It is possible however, that particular scriptural texts concerning the morality of musical instruments have been misunderstood. The Amish magazine Family Life states that the New Testament makes no mention to Christians using instruments in their worship; but that music is evil, such as in 1 Corinthians 14:7, where the apostle Paul compares spiritual deadness to the sound of musical instruments. However, I would argue that on closer inspection, Paul is not saying that people are lifeless or spiritually dead if they play the pipe or the harp. Rather, it is the instrument itself that is lifeless. Consequently, I argue that this verse should be more accurately understood as saying that inanimate objects like musical instruments cannot give God glory like a human heart can. Furthermore, another scripture, strangely referenced, is Amos 6:5. This is a peculiar verse to quote, as nowhere in this verse is music referred to as evil, unless King David is considered evil. The question that then arises is whether preconceived notions of the reformers concerning musical instruments being worldly and "bad" is distracting from a more correct biblical

hermeneutic? This is a question that would call for further dedicated research. Below, I have included the instruments that were used and in which church they were used [23].

Table 1: Distribution of Musical Instruments Across the Selected Churches

	FM C	FR MC	H MC	HC MC	JM C	PV MC	PL MC	S M C	ST MC	TM C
Pitch pipe										
Guitar										
Piano										
Violin										
Drums										
Flute										
Organ										
Trumpet										
Cello										
Whistle										
Ukelele										
French Horn										
Tuba										

As seen above, all of the 10 churches, except Journey and Trinity-highly "modern" churches use the pitch pipe-a standard musical aid in Mennonite worship. However, there are some instruments used which may not be considered "classical" in use, such as the accordion, French horn, cello, tuba, ukelele, the whistle and the trumpet. One argument for the use of instruments centres around the common pitch pipe. It is used to obtain the correct key, and if this was allowed, churches then had to consider whether pianos, guitars, organs and other instruments should be allowed too? The catch to this argument, however, is that Mennonites don't consider the pitch pipe to be an instrument, as it does not go with singing. Furthermore, John Price says that music attracts people and could exploit their emotions (Table 1). He says that sometimes large numbers of people go to church because they like the music, so Christians may fall prey to the mistake that the musically charged atmosphere is the

Holy Spirit, but actually these descriptions are testimony of the deceptive power of music over the emotional nature. This argument implies two possibilities [24]. The first is that musical instruments were meant implicitly here. The second is that musical instruments are too “worldly” for Mennonite churches and this has been further considered by Lapp. Lapp states that some Mennonite traditions taught that musical instruments were too individualistic and as such, not aligned with Anabaptist simplicity, leading to four-part a cappella singing becoming the norm, particularly in Old Order churches. However eventually ‘...chorister-led congregational singing made way for organist-led hymns...’ even if the organ was not always warmly welcomed, as seen in a letter from members of Plains Mennonite Church (1970) [25]. They argued that an organ was completely against Anabaptist principles, and that it is associated with ‘...American Christendom which is identified with and part of the church/state image. This view seems to have continued, as one Mennonite woman I spoke to, stated that her grandfather would not even entertain the thought of going to a church that used an organ-the fear that one may end up worshipping the organ rather than God was palpable [26]. The maintained belief was that the Anabaptists originally distanced themselves, and endeavour to continue to do so, from a potential church/state link, which an expensive organ could not aid them in doing-none of the Mennonite and wider Anabaptist emphases on ‘simplicity, modesty, brotherhood, discipleship, and stewardship...’ would be privy to separation [27]. Likewise, Klassen explains the Old Colony Mennonite disdain toward musical instruments through another Anabaptist ideal-the unacceptability of pride. She explains that musical instruments such as guitars and harmonicas, among others, were proscribed by churches as too worldly and encouraging of pride. Unsurprisingly, it is a different story with evangelical Mennonites, who adopt the opposite view to their old colony counterparts. They celebrated and prescribed musical instruments within worship to accompany congregational singing-making room for the piano, clarinet, the drums, the guitar, the flute and the violin. The Mennonite Brethren also allowed a range of instruments to create a worship atmosphere that was full of life and celebration, using the harmonica and violin during their services in the 1800s. So, it soon became common to hear ‘...flutes, reed organs, and pianos, electric organs, and guitars at MB services. In the 1960s drums and tambourines...’ began to appear more frequently. Young people were especially drawn to the use of instruments in worship services. Although becoming more popular, instruments were not present at every MB

Church’ [28]. Nevertheless, the sound most treasured and loved in Mennonite worship is still unaccompanied voices singing hymns together in harmony, and it is what they sung and sing that I will now consider.

5. Which Hymns did they Sing?

Mennonite culture and hymns could be seen as being in between an old and new way of music-the former being slow, and the latter embracing rhythm and harmony. Therefore, the creation of a musical corpus that will profit all is a vital part of worship, but it must reflect and cultivate tradition and culture. While hymnals strove to reflect Mennonitism, some members questioned which culture was being reflected, suggesting that there was not a purely Mennonite repertoire? What happened to the old German hymns that were sung? Surprisingly, German hymns were not valued by the 1927 Old Order Mennonite Church Hymnal. This is surprising because if the desire were to return to the early church, the German hymns may be expected. However, the Mennonite Hymnary raised up the German material, explaining that the language of their ‘...forefathers, is rich in hymns and tunes of the highest spiritual value [29]. Tice tries to debunk this question about the lack of Germanic influence in the Church Hymnal. He explains that it was heavily influenced by English musical traditions, along with non-denominational influences. These influences included 50 texts from Isaac Watts, along with a Methodist influence through the 33 hymns from Charles Wesley that were present. He continues explaining that the committee in charge of the Church Hymnal chose particular hymns to reflect the scriptural view they wished to propagate, rather than emotions that the hymns may bring. The committee believed that music should allow people to satisfactorily worship and revere God, rather than the ‘...lighter and more emotional song form of the modern age [30]. If there was a large English and Methodist influence in the Church Hymnal, the Mennonite Hymnary soon put a stop to that, taking the 83 hymns of Watts and Wesley down to 20 from Watts and 24 from Wesley. This minimisation of the number of texts by these authors is in part due to the 25 translations of German hymn texts completed by Catherine Winkworth. ‘In Mennonite Hymnary, few Mennonites are named among authors and composers’ [31]. I maintain that the distribution change of hymns continues to highlight the lack of a ‘real’ Mennonite hymnological or musicological identity. However, it also highlights how difficult a task it could be to create a distinctly Mennonite repertoire, as Mennonite hymns seem to derive from many nations and cultures. Whilst this shows that the repertoire is expanding, I

would be concerned that a 'true' or 'pure' Mennonite hymnody may be lost. The successor to the Mennonite Hymnal-the 1992 Hymnal: A Worship Book, used more non-western hymns and an increase in evangelical music, with one member from the General Conference Mennonite Church even suggested that Mennonite worship is now reminiscent of multiple practices trying to find a theology through music. This is a big change from original attempts to preserve old Anabaptist hymns; perhaps suggesting that Mennonite theology has become malleable, despite, I would argue, the continuation of Mennonite hymn singing trying to develop an image of who they want to be-God fearing people who love each other. Despite differences, they uphold each member of their group(s) as Mennonite, sharing a common religious identity, but divided in their music. Whilst appearing unified, Dueck has stated that sometimes members saw themselves as more "Mennonite" because they didn't sing choruses. Despite this potential disunity, the hymnals of the Mennonite Church USA and Canada had four hymns in particular that were classed as faith defining. Firstly, "Gott ist die Liebe" reveals a '...simple, yet profound truth: God loves all people, because God is love...' [32]. Secondly, "I bind my heart this tide-sung with a mournful melody, reminiscent of persecution. Thirdly, "what is this place," which has become a pillar of the faith since its feature in Hymnal: A Worship Book in 1992. Lastly, "Lord you have come to the lakeshore," which Mennonites came to learn during the World Conference assembly in 1990, where it soon made its way into Hymnal: A Worship Book and then later in Voices Together. Despite there being prominent hymns, more than 100 songs that had been written after 1960 were not included in any hymnals. Majoritively, they were contemporary praise and worship songs, and these tended to be relegated to two lesser-known collections: Sing Alleluia and Hymns for Worship and Celebration. Thirty pieces were common to both, 25 were exclusively found in Sing Alleluia and only 15 were found in Worship and Celebration. Gradually, younger Mennonites began favouring popular praise and worship songs, despite their evangelical nature. Consequently, in 1969, the Mennonite Hymnal had adopted a few '...non-western hymns and Anglo-American folk hymns...' [33]. Further, Hymnal: A Worship Book also tackled the question of which hymns should be sung, culminating in the agreement that hymns of African, African American, First Nations, Latin America and Asian hymns '...enriched the worship life of Mennonites...' this realisation created a shift in Mennonite musical preferences, as well as bringing the Mennonite Brethren into a hymnological space of acceptance of contemporary Christian music [34]. To demonstrate the favouring of contemporary music,

Hiebert identified that 100 out of 317 hymns that were used fell into this category. Consequently, there was an '...explosion of songs of the CCM type in the 1960' and by the 1980s the acceptance had truly taken off, with church leaders asking which songs were considered the best of the CCM genre' [35]. In order to find the best, Sing Alleluia was published in 1985, containing just 127 songs. However, of those 127, 62 were contemporary Christian songs, 27 gospel songs, 24 hymns and 14 miscellaneous. As the hymn preferences changed, Jong identifies that other aspects changed too-some Mennonites have started to clap and 'Some even sway a little' [36]. Any investigation into the musical legacy of Mennonites focuses on their singing, however in 1990, a survey of Mennonite Brethren congregations that used English hymnals was undertaken, and it is from this 1990 list that my research stemmed.

6. Results

Two major musicological shifts have taken place within Mennonitism over the past 130 years. The first was a distinct development post-1870 of the use of gospel music. This style of music was influenced by American musicians and the British Moody/Sankey revivals, which tried to bring gospel and evangelical music to the masses. The second influence was the frequency of contemporary Christian music in Mennonite hymnals. This not only changed the repertoire but also indicated how strong the influence of post-1960s, evangelicalism was upon churches like the Mennonite Brethren. The Mennonite Brethren enjoyed and celebrated gospel hymns, as they often had simple harmonies, which I argue made them fit for, and in keeping with the Mennonite tradition of oral transmission of hymns. I would argue that the reason that simple harmonies were used and were useful to congregations was that the more easily "singable" a tune is, the more it can be easily adopted. However, I maintain that the assumption of gospel songs arriving and fitting into the service without problem should be avoided. Incorporating gospel songs through both choirs and musical instruments into services was a massive change to the Mennonite worship style, and there was resistance to this contemporary music. Eventually though, most accepted it, but two questions remain-how much did gospel music become "canon" and how do you create a Mennonite "canon" through a hymnal? The hymnal itself could be considered a type of canon, but quite often, hymnals will include more hymns than one congregation can use and will use, as the Mennonite tradition is very keen on repetition of particular hymns, which is something I have continued to witness in my own

research. Due to the repetition, particular hymns become apparent as “heart songs”. These seem to be certain hymns with particular cultural and theological themes, such as “Come Thou Fount of Every Blessing” the English hymn written by Robert Robinson in the 18th century. The question that then follows is what else should be used in the canon? Hymnal authors seemed to refer to everything as hymns. However, hymnal collators included everything as hymns, such as chants, spiritual songs, gospel and contemporary songs to music from other cultures; suggesting that they felt everything should be included and represented in the corpus. Whilst I agree that diversity and inclusion in a hymnal is important, it actively denies previous attempts to unify and strategically choose hymns that would reflect a particular theology and belief(s). To consider everything as a “hymn,” it does seem to promote some kind of unity between Mennonite churches and the churches of the wider world-they were moving more into the modern era of music. However, I would argue that it actually has the opposite effect. By including everything in a hymnal as a hymn, it has the potential to create more difficulties and issues when deciding upon suitable worship music. As a result, there is not just a question of what style of worship music is appropriate, but how ‘...in connection with music, power is exercised and received in a particular Mennonite context...’ which is what the 1990 study originally tried to explain [37].

6.1. Hymns of the 1990s

The author of the 1990 survey examined the frequency of the 317 most used hymns throughout Mennonite Brethren congregations. This research was useful for me when identifying the shift of hymn preferences, not just within Mennonite Brethren congregations, but also within the wider Mennonite Church, which my research considered. The author found that there were 2,637 songs in total that were most frequently used in 1990 and the distribution is as follows: 200 songs from the Worship Hymnal made up 63% of the list, and 72 from Sing Alleluia, comprising 40-41%. In total, 271 songs from these two books were used, accounting for 85% of the complete list. Further, there were 66 songs from Evangeliums-lieder, comprising 21%: 93 songs (29%) from Triumphant Service Songs, and 100 songs (32%) from Tabernacle Hymns #3. Below I have listed the most popular of the 317 and I have compared their frequency then to the frequency from 2020-2023.

Table 2: The 1990 List

Hymn name	1990 frequency	2020-2023 frequency
Our Father	0x	174x
Doxology	56x	160x
Come Thou Fount of every Blessing	69x	52x
I love you Lord (Goodness of God)	122x	44x
Be thou my Vision	0x	42x
Joy to the World	143x	39x
O Come all ye faithful	177x	34x
Great is thy Faithfulness	179x	32x
Come let us all unite to sing	95x	32x
Amazing grace	126x	30x
To God be the glory	194x	30x
How Great thou art	173x	28x
O come O come Immanuel	71x	28x
Holy, holy, holy	138x	27x
The love of God	42x	26x
I sing the mighty power of God	85x	25x
O for a thousand tongues to sing	145x	24x
We praise thee O God	118x	23x
For the beauty of the earth	74x	23x
In Christ Alone	0x	23x
Wonderful grace of Jesus	97x	20x
It is well (when peace like a river)	83x	20x
Guide me oh thou great Jehovah	62x	20x
Come we that love the Lord	54x	20x
God of grace and God of glory	27x	19x
Hark the herald angels sing	105x	19x
Silent night	82x	19x
Come thou long expected Jesus	81x	19x
What child is this?	44x	19x
Oh little town of Bethlehem	86x	18x
What a fellowship	74x	18x
There's a wideness in God's mercy	26x	17x
Take my life and let it be	114x	17x
This is my father's world	55x	17x
Blessed assurance	128x	16x
Joyful, joyful we adore thee	133x	16x
My hope is built on nothing less	118x	16x
Praise to the Lord	99x	16x
Angels from the realms of glory	89x	15x
Spirit of the Living God	135x	14x
Away in a manger	68x	14x
Come Christians, join to sing	135x	13x
I have decided to follow Jesus	59x	13x
It Came upon a Midnight Clear	46x	13x

Garment of praise	60x	12x
O worship the King	129x	12x
You shall go out with joy	51x	12x
What a friend we have in Jesus	86x	11x
My Jesus, I love thee	83x	11x
When I survey	81x	11x
All hail the power of Jesus' name	124x	10x
Angels we have heard on high	89x	10x
Hosanna, loud hosanna	45x	10x
We praise thee O God	41x	10x
Crown him with many crowns	117x	9x
Trust and obey	116x	9x
We are one in the Spirit	48x	9x
Brethren we have met to worship	33x	9x
In Christ there is no East or West	25x	9x
There is a redeemer	133x	9x
The first Noel	49x	8x
Come ye thankful people	46x	8x
My faith has found a resting place	82x	8x
I need thee every hour	55x	8x
Christ is our cornerstone	26x	8x
This is the day	145x	8x
Just as I am	35x	7x
I stand amazed	80x	7x
Give to our God immortal praise	37x	7x
I will enter His Gates	224x	7x
I know whom I have believed	90x	6x
All the way my saviour leads	41x	6x
All glory laud and honour	40x	6x
Day by Day	33x	6x
May the mind of Christ	55x	5x
Come thou almighty king	98x	5x
Worthy is the lamb	56x	4x
Gentle shepherd	50x	4x
Be still and know	148x	4x

Most interestingly was the “Our Father” (the Lord’s Prayer). During the 1990 survey, this hymn did not make it onto the list. However, it was sung 174 times from 2020-2023. This may indicate a changing or developing theology, as it is one of the most important prayers in the Bible-why was it not there previously? Additionally, there were other hymns that did not feature in the 1990 list but were far more common between 2020 and 2023. One of these was the Doxology, sometimes suggested as the Mennonite national anthem. The Doxology was sung 56 times in 1990, but during my research it was sung 83 times. Frustratingly, however, the sudden resurgence of

this hymn seems to have no has no discernible reason. Further, “Be Thou my Vision” has become more popular, being sung 27 times during my research, in comparison with 0 times in 1990. However the one hymn that I would argue suggests a changing repertoire more obviously is the contemporary gospel song “In Christ Alone.” Something I noted with all 10 churches was that there was a wide array of hymns and songs being sung. As a result, this vast musical variety suggests to me that the repertoire is growing larger than ever before, and that musical tastes are changing amongst Mennonite churches. To demonstrate this, the following table shows the most popular hymns, spanning from those common to all 10 churches, down to those common to only 5, and the table has been split into appropriate sections to demonstrate this (Table 2).

Table 3: Hymns and Songs Common to Five or More Churches

	F M C	F R M C	H M C	H C M C	J M C	P L M C	P V M C	S M C	S T M C	T M C
VT 563/ TH 521/ HOC 699: Come thou fount of every blessing										
VT 240/ TH 125/ HOC 267: Joy to the world										
VT 332: In Christ Alone										
VT 617/ TH 493/ HOC 806: When peace like a river (It is well)										
VT 76/ TH 262/ TCH 29: Holy holy holy										
VT 549/ TH 382/ BH 545/ HOC 375: Be thou my vision										
VT 241/ TH 145: Oh come all ye faithful										
VT 759/ CH 374/ TH 379: Take my life										
VT 419/ TH 43/ MOP 216/ CH 100: Great is thy faithfulness										
VT 436/ GH 111/ TH 4/ HOC 128: How great thou art										
VT 210: O come O come Immanuel										
VT 70/71: Praise God from whom all blessings flow										

[illegible][illegible]

VT 401: Open the eyes of my heart Lord									
VT 555/ HOC 699/ TH 514: Lord, I am fondly, earnestly longing									
VT 634: Rain, come down									
VT 740/ TH 247: Spirit of the Living God									
VT 1: Summoned by the God who made us									
VT 180/ TH 58/ HOC 161: This is my father's world									
VT 329/ HOC 247: Were you there?									
VT 502/ TH 419/ HOC 644: Abide with me									
VT 411/ CH 163: All hail the power of Jesus name									
VT 49: All who are Thirsty									
VT 315/ HOC 177: All glory laud and honour									
VT 257: Away in a Manger									
VT 551: Beautiful things									
VT 664/ CH 639/ TH 347: Be still my soul									
VT 223: Bless'd be the God of Israel									
VT 25: Brethren we have met to worship									
VT 92: Build my life									
VT 4: Christ is our cornerstone									
VT 9: Come away from rush and hurry									
VT 31/ TH 18/ HOC 30: Come we that love the Lord									
VT 408: Crown him with many crowns									
Gentle Shepherd come and lead us									
VT 178: God of wonders									
Goodness of God									
VT 830: Go my children with my blessing									
VT 839: Go ye now in peace									
VT 217: Hark the glad sound									

VT 644: Healer of our every ill									
VT 813: Heart with loving heart united									
VT 227: Here I am to worship/ich will dich anbeten									
VT 545: Here I am Lord									
VT 10: Here in this place									
VT 369: There's nothing worth more									
VT 313: Hosanna, loud hosanna									
VT 605/ TH 580: My life flows on									
VT 116: How great is our God									
VT 390: In Christ there is no East or West									
VT 248/ HOC 221: It came upon a midnight clear									
VT 306: I want Jesus to walk with me									
Jesus Messiah									
VT 714: Let there be light									
VT 11: Mountain of God									
VT 597: My lighthouse									
VT 621/ TH 343: My hope is built on nothing less									
VT 653/ STJ 121: Nothing is lost on the breath of God									
VT 325: Oh sacred head now wounded									
VT 608/ HOC 514/ TH 374: Oh love that will not let me go									
Oh worship the king									
VT 131: Praise, I will praise you Lord									
VT 610/ TH 463: Precious Lord take my hand									
VT 415: Revelation song									
VT 812: Sent forth by God's blessing									
VT 122: Sing to the God of harvest									
VT 603: Still my soul									

VT 250/ TH 136: The First Noel										
VT 832/ STJ 73: The Lord lift you up										
The Solid Rock										
VT 156: There's a wideness in God's mercy										
VT 387/ TH 284: We are one in the Spirit										
This is amazing grace										
What a beautiful name										
VT 628/ HOC 652/ TH 435: What a friend we have in Jesus										
VT 22: What is this place										
VT 322/ GH 225: When I survey the wondrous cross										
VT 540: Will you come and follow me?										
You are holy										
VT 847: You shall go out with joy										

As seen above, "Come Thou Fount of Every Blessing". "Joy to the World" "When peace like a River" "Holy Holy Holy" "Be thou my Vision" "Oh Come all ye Faithful" and "Take my Life" are the hymns sung by the most churches. However, I would argue that the inclusion of "In Christ Alone" suggests that certain praise and worship songs may be becoming more popular amongst churches and have the potential to become heart songs.

6.2. The Churches

During my research, I considered the following: the hymns and the frequency of which they were sung, and if they were sung accapella or accompanied. I also examined which hymnal(s) were used, to consider the range of sources.

6.3. Fairview Mennonite Church

In keeping with traditional Anabaptism, there is exclusively male leadership, but with male and female musicians, demonstrating a nod to more modern ways of doing church? During my research, it became apparent that Fairview used Voices Together-a specifically Mennonite hymnal, published in 2020. However, surprisingly, they also made use of The Hymnal for Worship and Celebration (TH), which is a non-denominational hymnal published in 1986, along with Melodies of Praise (MOP), which was originally an Assemblies of God hymnal, associated with

pentecostalism, published in 1957. Below is the data I have collected from Fairview (Table 3 & 4).

Table 4: Fairview Mennonite Church

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella?	Instrument(s)
Goodness of God	21x		Guitar, Piano
Oh praise the name	20x		Guitar, Piano
Jesus strong and kind	17x		Piano
Yet not I but through Christ in me	16x		Guitar, Piano, Violin
VT 4/ TH 404: Cornerstone	16x		Piano
VT 332: In Christ Alone	16x		Guitar, Piano flute
His mercy is more	14x		Guitar, Piano
How deep the father's love for us	14x		Piano
VT 163/ TH 202/ HOC 676: Amazing Grace	14x		Piano
VT 563/ TH 521/ HOC 699: Come thou fount of every blessing	14x	No/Yes	Piano
Living Hope	13x		Guitar, Piano
To the River	13x		Guitar
VT 436/ GH 111/ HOC 128/ TH 4: How great thou art	13x		Guitar, Piano
Garment of praise	12x		Guitar, Piano
VT 84/ HOC 76/ TH 66/ MOP 40: To God be the glory	12x	No/Yes	Guitar, Piano
VT 116: How great is our God	11x		Guitar, Piano
VT 637: Blessed be your name	11x		Piano

Jesus all for Jesus	10x		Guitar, Piano
VT 155: Lord I need you	10x		Guitar, Piano
What a beautiful name it is	9x		Guitar, Piano
Wonderful merciful saviour	9x		Piano
This is amazing grace	9x		Guitar, Piano
VT 70/ 71: Praise God from whom all blessings flow	9x	Yes	
TH 206: There is a redeemer	9x		Piano
VT 419/ CH 100/ TH 43/MOP 216: Great is thy faithfulness	9x		Piano
Before the throne of God above	8x		Piano
VT 111: 10,000 Reasons	8x		Guitar, Piano
VT 170/ HOC 673/ TH 198: Wonderful grace of Jesus	8x		Guitar, Piano
VT 227: Here I am to worship	8x		Guitar, Piano
VT 371: Come gracious spirit heavenly dove	8x	Yes	
TH 387/MOP 42: Oh to be like thee	8x	Yes/No	Piano
Beautiful one	7x		Guitar, piano
Christ is mine forevermore	7x		Guitar, Piano
God bless you, go with God	7x		Guitar, Piano
He has made me glad	7x		Guitar, Piano
Here is love	7x		Guitar, piano
How sweet it is	7x		Guitar
Jesus Messiah	7x		Guitar
Same power	7x		Guitar, Piano
We fall down	7x		Guitar, Piano
VT 415: Revelation song	7x		Piano
TH 512: I stand amazed	7x		Guitar, Piano
VT 560: Just as I am	7x		Guitar, Piano
Alive alive forevermore	6x		Guitar, Piano
At the cross	6x		Guitar, piano
Behold the lamb	6x		Piano

Blessed be the Lord God almighty	6x		Guitar, Piano
Hymn of Heaven	6x		Guitar, Piano
Mighty to save	6x		Guitar, Piano
My life is in you Lord	6x		Guitar, piano
Who you say I am	6x		Guitar, Piano
VT 31/ HOC 30/ TH 18: Come we that love the Lord	6x		Guitar, Piano
VT 162/ TH 67/ HOC 153: The love of God	6x		Guitar, Piano
VT 435/ TH 345: Blessed Assurance	6x		Guitar, Piano
VT 590/ TH 409: I know whom I have believed	6x		Piano
VT 606/ CH 280/ TH 51: Guide me oh thou great Jehovah	6x		Guitar, Piano
VT 617/ TH 493/ HOC 806: When peace like a river (It is well)	6x		Piano
Holy is the Lord	5x		Guitar, Piano
It is you	5x		Guitar, Piano
O Come to the altar	5x		Guitar, Piano
Shine Jesus shine	5x		Guitar, Piano
The wonderful cross	5x		Piano
VT 120/ HOC 877/ TH 560: For the beauty of the Earth	5x		Guitar, Piano
VT 180/ HOC 161/ TH 58: This is my Father's World	5x		Guitar, Piano
TH 288: Faithful men	5x		Guitar, Piano
TH 404: The Solid Rock	5x		Piano
TH 527: Glory to his name	5x		Guitar, Piano
VT 549/ TH 382/ BH 545/ HOC 375: Be thou my vision	5x		Piano
VT 626/ TH 496: A wonderful saviour is Jesus (He hideth my soul)	5x		Guitar, Piano
VT 740/ TH 247: Spirit of the living God	5x		Guitar, Piano

Below is a record of pieces that are less common within Fairview, but common to five or more other churches.

Table 5: Pieces Less Common within Fairview but Common in Five or More Other Churches

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
Thank you Jesus for the blood	4x		Piano
VT 29: Come, now is the time to worship	4x		Guitar, Piano
TH 45: Surely goodness and mercy	4x		Guitar, Piano
VT 182/ TH 59/ HOC 127: I sing the mighty power of God	4x		Guitar, Piano
VT 244/ TH 147: Silent night	4x		Guitar, Piano
VT 267/ HOC 227/ TH 137: What child is this?	4x		Guitar, Piano
TH 288: Faithful men	4x		Guitar, Piano
VT 401: Open the eyes of my heart Lord	4x		Guitar
TH 527: Glory to His name	4x		Guitar, Piano
VT 76/ TCH 29/ TH 262: Holy holy holy	3x		Guitar, Piano
VT 160/ TH 354/ HOC 648: Leaning on the Everlasting arms	3x		Piano
VT 218/ TH 125/ BH 178: Come thou long expected Jesus	3x		Guitar, Piano
VT 240/ TH 125/ HOC 267: Joy to the world	3x		Guitar, Piano
VT 248/ HOC 221: It came upon a midnight clear	3x		Guitar, Piano
VT 249/ TH 132: Angels we have heard on high	3x		Piano
VT 265/ HOC 213/ TH 131: Angels from the realms of glory	3x		Piano, violin
VT 333/ TH 216/ HOC 252: Low in the grave he lay	3x		Piano
VT 443/ CH 729: I have decided to follow Jesus	3x		Guitar, Piano
VT 759/ CH 374/ TH 379: Take my life	3x		Guitar, Piano
VT 25: Brethren we have met to worship	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 88/ TH 8: Praise to the Lord the Almighty	2x		Piano
VT 92/ TCH 520/ TH 295: We praise thee, O God	2x	Yes	
VT 103/ TH 1: Joyful joyful	2x		Piano

VT 133/ HOC 557/ TH 364: My Jesus I love thee	2x	Yes	
VT 210: O come O come Immanuel	2x		Piano
VT 241/ TH 145: Oh come all ye faithful	2x		Piano
VT 408/ HOC 259: Crown him with many crowns	2x		Piano, guitar
TH 458: Gentle shepherd	2x		Piano
VT 502/ HOC 644/ TH 419: Abide with me	2x		Piano
VT 608/ HOC 514/ TH 374: Oh love that will not let me go	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 610/ TH 463: Precious Lord take my hand	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 628/ HOC 652/ TH 435: What a friend we have in Jesus	2x		Piano
VT 78/ HOC 196: Oh for a thousand tongues to sing			Guitar, Piano
VT 123: Come ye thankful people come			Guitar, Piano
VT 245/ HOC 224: Oh little town of Bethlehem			Guitar, Piano
VT 247: Hark the Herald Angels sing			Guitar, piano
VT 250/ TH 136: The first Noel			Piano
VT 252/ TH 138: Go tell it on the mountain			Guitar, Piano
VT 259/ HOC 220: To us a child of hope is born			Guitar, Piano
VT 315/ HOC 177: All glory laud and honour			Piano
VT 329/ HOC 247: Were you there?			Piano- 4-part harmony
VT 340/ TH 275/ HOC 607: Lift your glad voices		Yes	
VT 364/ CH 163: All hail the power of Jesus' name			Piano, guitar
VT 387/ TH 284: We are one in the Spirit			Piano, guitar
VT 390: In Christ there is no East or West			Piano, guitar
VT 570: When we walk with the Lord			Piano
VT 592/ TH 275: How firm a foundation			Piano
VT 664/ CH 639/ TH 347: Be still my soul			Piano
VT 737/ HOC 609: Breathe on me breath of God			Piano

6.4. Franconia Mennonite Church

Like Fairview, Franconia also has male leadership with and male and female musicianship; however, there are a few more exclusively Mennonite hymnals present here, such as Hymnal: A Worship Book-published by the Church of the Brethren (1992), Sing the Story-published by the Mennonite General Conference (2007) as a supplemental worship book, and finally Voices Together (2020). However, Sing the Journey was originally published by the Unitarian Universalist Association of Congregations (2005), but the Celebrating Grace Hymnal is non-denominational (2010). Below is the data I have collected from Franconia (Table 5).

Table 6: Frequency and Musical Accompaniment of Selected Hymns

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
King of kings	9x		Guitar, piano
Rejoice	7x		Guitar, piano
My soul will wait	6x		Guitar, piano, drums
Only a holy God	6x		Guitar, piano
There is one gospel	6x		Guitar, piano
We will feast in the house of Zion	6x		Guitar, piano
All my boast is in Jesus	5x		Guitar, piano
Goodness of God	5x		Guitar, piano
Magnificent, marvellous, matchless love	5x		Guitar, piano, drums
Such an awesome God	5x		Piano

Below is a record of pieces that are less common within Franconia but are common to five or more other churches (Table 6).

Table 7: Frequency of Hymn Usage and Musical Accompaniment

Hymn	Frequency	Acappella ?	Instrument (s)
VT 76/ TH 262/ TCH 29: Holy holy holy	4x		Guitar, piano
VT 92: Build my life	4x		Guitar, piano

VT 502/ TH 419/ HOC 644: Abide with me	4x		Piano
VT 563/ TH 521/ HOC 699: Come thou fount of every blessing	4x		Guitar, piano
VT 621/ TH 343: My hope is built on nothing less	4x		Guitar, piano
VT 7/ HOC 143: Come let us all unite to sing	3x		Guitar, piano
VT 84/ TH 66/ MOP 40/ HOC 76: To God be the glory	3x	No/Yes	Guitar, piano
VT 160/ TH 354/ HOC 648: Leaning on the Everlasting arms	3x		Guitar, piano
VT 227: Here I am to worship	3x		Guitar, piano
VT 435/ TH 345: Blessed Assurance	3x		Guitar, piano
VT 549/ TH 382/ BH 545/ HOC 375: Be thou my vision	3x		Guitar, piano
VT 555/ HOC 699/ TH 514: Lord I am fondly earnestly longing	3x		Piano
VT 617/ TH 493/ HOC 806: When peace like a river (It is well)	3x	Yes	
VT 626/ TH 496: A wonderful saviour is Jesus (He hideth my soul)	3x		Piano
VT 715/ STJ 54: Longing for light	3x		Guitar, piano
This is amazing grace	2x		Guitar, piano
VT 28/ TH 49: Come Christians join to sing	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 133/ HOC 557/ TH 364: My Jesus I love thee	2x		Guitar, piano
VT 162/ TH 67/ HOC 153: The love of God	2x	Yes	
VT 240/ TH 125/ HOC 267: Joy to the world	2x		Piano
VT 241/ TH 145: Oh come all ye faithful	2x		Piano
VT 245/ HOC 224: Oh little town of Bethlehem	2x	Yes	
VT 247: Hark the herald angels sing	2x		Guitar, piano

VT 259/ HOC 220: To us a child of hope is born	2x		Piano
VT 265/ HOC 213/ TH 131: Angels from the realms of glory	2x	Yes	
VT 332: In Christ Alone	2x		Guitar, piano
VT 419/ TH 43/ MOP 216/ CH 100: Great is thy Faithfulness	2x		Piano
VT 420/ STJ 27: God of the Bible	2x		Guitar, piano, drums
VT 570: When we walk with the Lord	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 740/ TH 247: Spirit of the living God	2x		Piano
VT 759/ CH 374/ TH 379: Take my life	2x	Yes/No	Piano
VT 813: Heart with loving heart united	2x		Guitar, piano
How deep the father's love for us		Yes	
Jesus Messiah			Guitar, piano
You are holy			Guitar, piano
VT 4/ TH 404: Cornerstone			Guitar, piano
VT 11: Mountain of God		Yes	
VT 22: What is this place?			Piano
VT 49: All Who are Thirsty			Piano, guitar, drums
VT 70/71: Praise God from whom all blessings flow		Yes	
VT 78/ HOC 196: Oh for a thousand tongues to sing			Guitar
VT 88/ TH 8: Praise to the Lord the almighty			Guitar, piano
VT 91/ TCH 520/ TH 295: We praise thee, O God			Guitar, piano, drums
VT 98/ HOC 107: Immortal Invisible			Piano
VT 103/ TH 1: Joyful joyful			Guitar, piano
VT 111: 10,000 Reasons			Guitar, piano
VT 116: How great is our God			Piano, guitar
VT 120/ HOC 877/ TH 560: For the beauty of the Earth			Guitar, piano
VT 123: Come ye thankful people come			Guitar, piano

VT 155: Lord I need you			Guitar, piano
VT 163/ TH 202/ HOC 676: Amazing Grace			Piano
VT 170/ HOC 673/ TH 198: Wonderful grace of Jesus			Piano
VT 178: God of wonders			Piano
VT 180/ TH 58/ HOC 161: This is my father's world			Guitar
VT 210: O come O come Immanuel			Guitar
VT 218/ TH 125/ BH 178: Come thou long expected Jesus			Piano
VT 244/ TH 147: Silent night			Guitar, piano
VT 252/ TH 138: Go tell it on the mountain			Piano
VT 267/ HOC 227/ TH 137: What child is this?		Yes	
VT 313: Hosanna, loud hosanna			Guitar, piano
VT 317/ HOC 587: Go to dark Gethsemane			Piano
VT 322/ GH 225: When I survey the wondrous cross			Piano, guitar
VT 325: Oh sacred head now wounded			Piano
VT 333/ TH 216/ HOC 252: Low in the grave he lay			Piano
VT 340/ TH 275/ HOC 607: Lift your glad voices			Piano
VT 369: There's nothing worth more			Guitar
VT 401: Open the eyes of my heart Lord			Guitar, piano
VT 408/ HOC 259: Crown him with many crowns			Piano, guitar
VT 415: Revelation song			Guitar, piano
VT 436/ GH 111/ TH 4/ HOC 128: How great thou art			Guitar, piano
VT 443/ CH 729: I have decided to follow Jesus			Piano
VT 456: Oceans			Guitar, piano
VT 496/ HOC 48: I owe the Lord a morning song			Piano
VT 502/ TH 419/ HOC 644: Abide with me			Piano
VT 592/ TH 275: How firm a foundation			Guitar, piano

VT 605/ TH 580: My life flows on			Piano
VT 606/ CH 280/ TH 51: Guide me oh thou great Jehovah		Yes	
VT 608/ HOC 514/ TH 374: Oh love that will not let me go			Piano, guitar
VT 628/ HOC 652/ TH 435: What a friend we have in Jesus			Piano
VT 737/ HOC 609: Breathe on me breath of God			Piano
VT 839: Go ye now in peace		Yes	
VT 846: The Lord bless you and keep you			Guitar, piano

6.5. Harrisonburg Mennonite Church

Harrisonburg Mennonite Church was the first church with male and female leadership as well as male and female musicians. This may suggest at face-value, that they are a “modern” church. However, this is not the case, as there exists a harmonious blend between the old and the new with one service at 08:30 am, featuring more of the old way of music, with more pieces being sung accapella, and one at 11:00 am, representing the new with a worship band. The times that both services combine further suggests a balance between both ways of worship. The only hymnal that was used within this church was Voices Together; however I have included within the table the corresponding hymn numbers in other hymnals. Below is the data I have collected from Harrisonburg Mennonite Church (Table 7).

Table 8: Frequency of Hymns, a Cappella Usage, and Musical Instruments

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
VT 839: Go ye now in peace	21x		Organ
VT 597: My lighthouse	10x		Guitar, piano
VT 240/ TH 125/ HOC 267: Joy to the world	9x		Piano, guitar, drums
VT 76/ TH 262/ TCH 29: Holy holy holy	8x	No/Yes	Piano

VT 476: Eat this bread	8x		Piano
VT 715/ STJ 54: Longing for light	8x		Piano, guitar
VT 29: Come now is the time to worship	7x		Piano, guitar, drums
VT 62: God is here among us	7x		Piano
VT 70/71: Praise God from whom all blessings flow	7x	Yes	
VT 832/ STJ 73: The Lord lift you up	7x		Guitar
VT 1: Summoned by the God who made us	6x	Yes	
VT 156: There's a wideness in God's mercy	6x	Yes	
VT 210: O come O come Immanuel	6x		Piano
VT 419/ TH 43/ MOP 216/ CH 100: Great is thy faithfulness	6x	Yes	
VT 685: Oh lord hear my prayer	6x		Guitar
VT 846: The Lord Bless you and keep you	6x		Piano, guitar
Way maker	6x		Piano, guitar
This is amazing grace	5x		Piano, guitar
VT 10: Here in this place	5x	Yes/no	Piano, guitar
VT 28: Come, Christians join to sing	5x	Yes	
VT 33: You are good	5x		Piano, guitar
VT 34: We praise you, O God, our redeemer	5x	Yes	
VT 91/ TCH 520/ TH 295: We praise thee, O God	5x	Yes	
VT 227: Here I am to worship	5x		Piano
VT 415: Revelation Song	5x		Piano, guitar
VT 812: Sent forth by God's blessing	5x		Piano
VT 849: we your people sing your praises	5x	Yes	
What a beautiful name it is	5x		Piano, guitar

Below is a record of pieces that are less common within Harrisonburg but are common to five or more other churches (Table 8).

Table 9: Hymn List and Musical Details

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
Jesus Messiah	4x		Piano
VT 7/ HOC 143: Come let us all unite to sing	4x	Yes	
VT 9: Come away from rush and hurry	4x		Piano
VT 84/ TH 66/ MOP 40/ HOC 76: To God be the glory	4x	Yes	
VT 92: Build my life	4x	Yes	
VT 116: How great is our God	4x		Piano, guitar, drums
VT 155: Lord I need you	4x		Piano
VT 162/ TH 67/ HOC 153: The love of God	4x	Yes	
VT 163/ TH 202/ HOC 676: Amazing grace	4x		Piano, guitar
VT 322/ GH 225: When I survey the wondrous cross	4x		Piano
VT 332: In Christ alone	4x		Piano, guitar
VT 456: Oceans	4x		Piano, guitar
VT 540: Will you come and follow me?	4x		Piano
VT 605/ TH 580: My life flows on	4x		Piano
VT 621/ TH 343: My hope is built on nothing less	4x		Piano
VT 716/ HOC 360: God of grace and God of glory	4x	Yes	
VT 11: Mountain of God	3x		Guitar, piano
VT 22: What is this place?	3x	Yes	
VT 31/ TH 18/ HOC 30: Come we that love the Lord	3x		Piano, guitar
VT 70/71: Praise God from whom all blessings flow	3x	Yes	
VT 111: 10,000 reasons	3x		Piano, guitar
VT 131: Praise, I will praise you Lord	3x		Piano
VT 170/ HOC 673/ TH 198: Wonderful grace of Jesus	3x	Yes	

VT 182/ TH 59/ HOC 127: I sing the mighty power of God	3x	Yes	
VT 218/ TH 125/ BH 178: Come thou long expected Jesus	3x		Piano, guitar
VT 223: Bless'd be the God of Israel	3x	Yes	
VT 247: Hark the herald angels sing	3x		Piano
VT 267/ HOC 227/ TH 137: What child is this?	3x		Piano
VT 387/ TH 284: We are one in the Spirit	3x		Piano
VT 401: Open the eyes of my heart Lord	3x		Guitar, piano
VT 436/ GH 111/ TH 4/ HOC 128: How great thou art	3x		Piano, guitar, drums
VT 551: Beautiful things	3x		Guitar, piano
VT 563/ TH 521/ HOC 699: Come thou fount of every blessing	3x	Yes	
VT 640/ HOC 172: My shepherd will supply my need	3x		Piano
VT 813: Heart with loving heart united	3x	Yes	
Goodness of God	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 4: Christ is our cornerstone	2x	Yes	
VT 25: Brethren we have met to worship	2x		Guitar
VT 49: All who are thirsty	2x		Piano, guitar, drums
VT 57: Holy Spirit come with power	2x	Yes	
VT 88/ TH 8: Praise to the Lord the almighty	2x	Yes	
VT 98/ HOC 107: Immortal Invisible	2x	Yes	
VT 123: Come ye thankful people come	2x		Piano
VT 131: Praise, I will praise you Lord	2x		Piano
VT 160/ HOC 648/ TH 354: Leaning on the everlasting arms	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 178: God of Wonders	2x		Piano, guitar, violin, drums
VT 241/ TH 145: Oh come all ye faithful	2x		Piano

VT 244/ TH 147: Silent night	2x		Guitar
VT 249/ TH 132: Angels we have heard on high	2x		Piano
VT 250/ TH 136: The First Noel	2x		Piano, guitar, drums
VT 252/ TH 138: Go tell it on the mountain	2x		Guitar, piano, drums
VT 257: Away in a manger	2x		Piano
VT 259/ HOC 220: To us a child of hope is born	2x		Organ, piano
VT 313: Hosanna, loud hosanna	2x		
VT 333/ TH 216/ HOC 252: Low in the grave he lay	2x		Organ
VT 340/ TH 275/ HOC 607: Lift your glad voices	2x		Organ
VT 369: There's nothing worth more	2x		Guitar
VT 496/ HOC 48: I owe the Lord a morning song	2x		Piano
VT 545: Here I am Lord	2x		Piano
VT 549/ TH 382/ BH 545/ HOC 375: Be thou my vision	2x		Piano
VT 555/ HOC 699/ TH 514: Lord I am fondly earnestly longing	2x	Yes	
VT 626/ TH 496: A wonderful saviour is Jesus (He hideth my soul)	2x	Yes	
VT 634: Rain, come down	2x		Piano
VT 714: Let there be light	2x	Yes	
VT 737/ HOC 609: Breathe on me breath of God	2x	Yes	
VT 740/ TH 247: Spirit of the living God	2x	Yes	
VT 830: Go my children with my blessing	2x		Piano
VT 847: You shall go out with joy	2x		Piano
How deep the father's love for us			Piano, guitar, drums
VT 47/ HOC 81: God of our strength		Yes	
VT 120/ HOC 877/ TH 560: For the beauty of the Earth		Yes	

VT 122: Sing to the God of the harvest			Organ
VT 133: My Jesus I love thee			Piano
VT 217: Hark the glad sound			Piano, guitar
VT 245/ HOC 224: Oh little town of Bethlehem		Yes	
VT 265/ HOC 213/ TH 131: Angels from the realms of glory			Piano
VT 306: I want Jesus to walk with me			Piano
VT 325: Oh sacred head now wounded		Yes	
VT 329/ HOC 247: Were you there?		Yes	
VT 361/ HOC 249: Christ who left his home in glory		Yes	
VT 377: New Earth, Heavens new			Piano, guitar, drums
VT 390: In Christ there is no East or West		Yes	
VT 408/ HOC 259: Crown him with many crowns		Yes	
VT 411/ CH 163: All hail the power of Jesus name			Piano
VT 420/ STJ 27: God of the Bible			Piano
VT 443/ CH 729: I have decided to follow Jesus			Piano, guitar
VT 536/ CH 215: I heard the voice of Jesus say		Yes	
VT 570: When we walk with the Lord		Yes	
VT 592/ TH 275: How firm a foundation		Yes	
VT 606/ CH 280/ TH 51: Guide me oh thou great Jehovah		Yes	
VT 610/ TH 463: Precious Lord take my hand			Organ
VT 617/ TH 493/ HOC 806: When peace like a river (It is well)		Yes	
VT 628/ HOC 652/ TH 435: What a friend we have in Jesus		Yes	
VT 644: Healer of our every ill			Piano
VT 653/ STJ 121: Nothing is lost on the breath of God			Piano
VT 664/ CH 639/ TH 347: Be still my soul		Yes	
VT 759/ CH 374/ TH 379: Take my life		Yes	

6.6. Hartville Conservative Mennonite Church

Hartville Conservative Mennonite Church has exclusively male leaders and male vorsengers, with all hymns being sung accapella. Hartville use Hymns of the Church, the Church Hymnal, the Hymnal for Worship and Celebration, and the Christian Hymnary-originally of Beachy Amish Mennonite origin (1972) perhaps suggesting a want to incorporate and keep alive old church connections. Below is the data I have collected from Hartville (Table 9).

Table 10: Most Frequently Used a Cappella Hymns

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?
HOC 6: Oh worship the king all glorious above	12x	Yes
VT 549/ TH 382/ BH 545/ HOC 375: Be thou my vision	11x	Yes
HOC 25 (Isaac Watts): bless oh my soul	9x	Yes
HOC 88: Eternal Father when to thee	9x	Yes
VT 608/ HOC 514/ TH 374: Oh love that will not let me go	9x	Yes
HOC 43: This is the day that the Lord hath made	8x	Yes
VT 162/ TH 67/ HOC 153: The love of God	8x	Yes
VT 496/ HOC 48: I owe the Lord a morning song	8x	Yes
HOC 630: My faith has found a resting place	8x	Yes
Jesus loves me	8x	Yes
HOC 1: Come o thou God of grace	7x	Yes
HOC 50: Hail holy light the world rejoices	7x	Yes
HOC 96: Let the whole creation cry	7x	Yes
VT 103/ TH 1: Joyful joyful we adore thee	7x	Yes
HOC 466: God will take care of you	7x	Yes

VT 626/ TH 496: A wonderful saviour is Jesus (He hideth my soul)	7x	Yes
TCH 824: give to our God immortal praise	7x	Yes
Alive alive alive forevermore	6x	Yes
CH 23: Great God indulge my humble claim	6x	Yes
HOC 44: oh day of rest and gladness	6x	Yes
HOC 310: Gentle Holy Spirit	6x	Yes
TCH 363: Jesus keep me near the cross	6x	Yes
VT 419/ TH 34/ MOP 216/ CH 100: Great is thy faithfulness	6x	Yes
HOC 520: Day by day	6x	Yes
VT 628/ HOC 652/ TH 435: What a friend we have in Jesus	6x	Yes
VT 737/ HOC 609: Breathe on me breath of God	6x	Yes
HOC 930: All the way my saviour leads me	6x	Yes
CH 5: Come thou almighty king	5x	Yes
CH 6: Open now thy gates of beauty	5x	Yes
HOC 7: Stand up and bless the Lord	5x	Yes
VT 47/HOC 81: God of our strength	5x	Yes
VT 98/ HOC 107: Immortal invisible	5x	Yes
HOC 171: My shepherd is the Heavenly Father Kind	5x	Yes
VT 182/ TH 59/ HOC 127: I sing the mighty power of God	5x	Yes
VT 210: O come O come Immanuel	5x	Yes
HOC 291: Oh the deep deep love of Jesus	5x	Yes
CH 314: Thou wilt keep him in perfect peace	5x	Yes
VT 333/ TH 216/ HOC 252: Low in the grave he lay	5x	Yes

HOC 457: May the mind of Christ my saviour	5x	Yes
HOC 501: We rest on thee	5x	Yes
VT 555/ HOC 699/ TH 514: Lord I am fondly earnestly longing	5x	Yes
HOC 626: in Heavenly love abiding	5x	Yes
VT 640/ HOC 172: My shepherd will supply my need	5x	Yes

Below is a record of pieces that are less common within Hartville but are common to five or more other churches (Table 10).

Table 11: Frequently Sung a Cappella Hymns

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?
VT 76/ TH 262/ TCH 29: Holy holy holy	4x	Yes
VT 259/ HOC 220: To us a child of hope is born	4x	Yes
VT 265/ HOC 213/ TH 131: Angels from the realms of glory	4x	Yes
VT 267/ HOC 227/ TH 137: What child is this?	4x	Yes
VT 364/ CH 163: All hail the power of Jesus' name	4x	Yes
VT 408/ HOC 259: Crown him with many crowns	4x	Yes
VT 436/ GH 111/ TH 4/ HOC 128: How great thou art	4x	Yes
VT 563/ TH 521/ HOC 699: Come thou fount	4x	Yes
VT 621/ TH 343: My hope is built on nothing less	4x	Yes
VT 4/ TH 404: Cornerstone	3x	Yes
VT 31/ TH 18/ HOC 30: Come we that love the Lord	3x	Yes
VT 120/ HOC 877/ TH 560: For the beauty of the Earth	3x	Yes
VT 133/ TH 364/ HOC 557: My Jesus I love thee/Mein Jesu ich liebe dich	3x	Yes
VT 160/ TH 354/ HOC 648: Leaning on the everlasting arms	3x	Yes
VT 180/ TH 58/ HOC 161: This is my father's world	3x	Yes

VT 217/ HOC 201: Hark the glad sound	3x	Yes
VT 240/ TH 125/ HOC 267: Joy to the world	3x	Yes
VT 241/ TH 145: Oh come all ye faithful	3x	Yes
VT 322/ GH 225: When I survey the wondrous cross	3x	Yes
VT 502/ TH 419/ HOC 644: Abide with me	3x	Yes
VT 759/ CH 374/ TH 379: Take my life	3x	Yes
VT 7/ HOC 143: Come let us all unite to sing	2x	Yes
VT 28/ TH 49: Come Christians, join to sing	2x	Yes
VT 70/ 71: Praise God from whom all blessings flow	2x	Yes
VT 78/ HOC 196: Oh for a thousand tongues to sing	2x	Yes
VT 84/ TH 66/ MOP 40/ HOC 76: To God be the glory	2x	Yes
VT 91/TCH 520/ TH 295: We praise thee, O God	2x	Yes
HOC 97: Praise to the Lord the almighty	2x	Yes
VT 244/ TH 147: Silent night	2x	Yes
VT 245/ HOC 224: Oh little town of Bethlehem	2x	Yes
VT 247: Hark the herald angels sing	2x	Yes
VT 248/ HOC 221: It came upon a Midnight Clear	2x	Yes
VT 257: Away in a manger	2x	Yes
VT 329/ HOC 247: Were you there?	2x	Yes
VT 332: In Christ alone	2x	Yes
VT 340/ TH 275/ HOC 607: Lift your glad voices	2x	Yes
VT 361/ HOC 249: Christ who left his home in glory	2x	Yes
VT 435/ TH 345: Blessed Assurance	2x	Yes
VT 443/ CH 729: I have decided to follow Jesus	2x	Yes
VT 536/ CH 215: I heard the voice of Jesus say	2x	Yes
VT 606/ CH 280/ TH 51: Guide me oh thou great Jehovah	2x	Yes
VT 617/ TH 493/ HOC 806: When peace like a river (It is well)	2x	Yes
VT 716/ HOC 360: God of grace and God of glory	2x	Yes
VT 123: Come ye thankful people come		Yes
VT 163/ TH 202/ HOC 676: Amazing grace		Yes
VT 170/ TH 198/ HOC 673: Wonderful grace of Jesus		Yes

VT 178: God of wonders		Yes
VT 315/ HOC 177: All glory laud and honour		Yes
VT 317/ HOC 587: Go to dark Gethsemane		Yes
VT 325: Oh Sacred Head now Wounded		Yes
VT 570: When we walk with the Lord		Yes
VT 664/ TH 347/ CH 639: Be still my soul		Yes
VT 714/ STJ 67: Let there be light		Yes
VT 740/ TH 247: Spirit of the Living God		Yes

6.7. Journey Mennonite Church

Journey Mennonite Church has both male and female leadership and musicians. However, where it differs from other churches is in the lack of mention made to any hymnal, highlighting its modern view of doing church. Below is the data I have collected from Journey (Table 11).

Table 12: Hymn Frequency and Instrumentation

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
Goodness of God	15x		Piano, guitar
Who you say I am	11x		Piano, guitar
Way maker	10x		Guitar, piano, violin
Be thou my vision	9x		Piano, guitar
King of kings	9x		Guitar, piano
Oh praise the name	9x		Piano, guitar
Cornerstone	8x		Guitar, piano, drums
Oh for a thousand tongues to sing	7x		Piano, guitar
Only king forever	7x		Guitar, piano
Come thou fount of every blessing	6x		Piano, guitar
Found in you	6x		Piano, guitar

I need thee every hour	6x		Guitar, violin
Praise God from whom all blessings flow	6x		Piano
What a beautiful name	6x		Violin, guitar
Amazing Grace	5x		Piano, guitar, drums
Build my life	5x		
Ever be	5x		Guitar
Gratitude	5x		Piano, guitar
There's nothing worth more	5x		Piano, guitar
This is my father's world	5x		Violin, guitar

Below are listed pieces common to five or more other churches (Table 12).

Table 13: Hymn Frequency and Instrumental Accompaniment

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
God of revival	4x		Piano, guitar
Make room	4x		Piano, guitar, drums
Oh come all ye faithful	4x		Piano, guitar
Revelation song	4x		Piano, guitar
Great are you Lord	4x		Piano, guitar
I speak Jesus	4x		Piano, guitar, drums
10,000 reasons	3x		Violin, guitar
My hope is built on nothing less	3x		Piano
To God be the glory	3x		Piano, guitar
Holy holy holy	3x		Piano, guitar
Lord I need you	3x		Piano, guitar
Take my life	3x		Violin, guitar
When peace like a river (It is well)	2x		Piano, guitar
In Christ alone	2x		Piano, guitar
Blessed Assurance	2x		Piano, guitar

O come O come Immanuel	2x		Piano, guitar
Great is thy faithfulness	2x		Piano
Go tell it on the mountain	2x		Piano, guitar, drums
How deep the Father's love for us	2x		Piano, guitar
Spirit of the Living God	2x		Piano, guitar
We are one in the Spirit	2x		Piano, guitar
The First Noel	2x		Piano, guitar
Come thou long expected Jesus			Violin, guitar, piano
Jesus Messiah			Guitar, violin
How great thou art			Piano, guitar
Joyful joyful			Guitar, violin
Joy to the world			Guitar, violin, drums
Silent night			Piano
I have decided to follow Jesus			Guitar
Oceans			Violin, guitar, piano
Oh little town of Bethlehem			Piano, guitar

6.8. Parkview Mennonite Church

Parkview Mennonite Church were another church with both male and female leadership and musicians. However, unlike others, they only use two Mennonite hymnals-Sing the Story and Voices Together. Below are the results of my data collection concerning Parkview (Table 13).

Table 14: Hymn Usage and Accompaniment Patterns

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
VT 674: Our Father who art in Heaven	174x	Yes	
VT 70/ 71: Praise God from whom all blessings flow	160x		Piano, Organ
We give thee but thine own	12x		Organ

VT 241/ TH 145: Oh come all ye faithful	9x		Organ, violin
VT 849: We your people, sing your praises	7x		Piano, guitar
VT 210: O come O come Immanuel	6x		Organ
VT 182/ TH 59/ HOC 127: I sing the mighty power of God	6x	No/Yes	Organ
VT 846: The Lord bless you and keep you	6x	Yes	
VT 7/ HOC 143: Come let us all unite to sing	5x	Yes	
VT 147: Kyrie Eleison	5x	Yes	
VT 211: Hope is a candle	5x		Piano, guitar
VT 216: Lo how a rose e'er blooming	5x		Violin
VT 223: Bless'd be the God of Israel	5x	Yes	
VT 239: He came down	5x		Piano, drums
VT 245/ HOC 224: Oh little town of Bethlehem	5x	Yes/No	Organ, cello
VT 274: See whose glory fills the skies	5x		Violin, piano, guitar
VT 420/ STJ 27: God of the Bible	5x		Piano

Below is a record of pieces that are less common within Parkview, and/or are common to five or more other churches (Table 14).

Table 15: Hymn Performance Frequency and Instrumentation

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
VT 11: Mountain of God	4x		Organ
VT 28: Come, Christians join to sing	4x	Yes	
VT 57: Holy Spirit come with power	4x		Organ
VT 78/ HOC 196: Oh for a thousand tongues to sing	4x	No/Yes	Piano, guitar
VT 98/ HOC 107: Immortal invisible	4x		Organ
VT 217/ HOC 201: Hark the glad sound	4x	Yes	
VT 244/ TH 147: Silent night	4x		Violin, cello, organ
VT 259/ HOC 220: To us a child of hope is born	4x	Yes/no	Organ

VT 275: Oh beautiful star of Bethlehem	4x	Yes	
VT 540: Will you come and follow me	4x		Clarinet, piano, guitar
VT 555/ HOC 699/ TH 514: Lord I am fondly earnestly longing	4x	Yes	
VT 592/ TH 275: How firm a foundation	4x	Yes/no	Organ
VT 812: Sent forth by God's blessing	4x		Organ, violin
VT 832/ STJ 73: The Lord lift you up	4x		Piano, guitar
VT 839: Go ye now in peace	4x		Organ, violin, guitar, piano
VT 1: Summoned by the God who made us	3x		Organ
VT 10: Here in this place	3x		Violin, guitar
VT 49: All who are thirsty	3x		Piano, violin
VT 84/ TH 66/ MOP 40/ HOC 76: To God be the glory	3x	Yes	
VT 103/ TH 1: Joyful joyful	3x	Yes	
VT 122: Sing to the God of Harvest	3x		Organ
VT 240/ TH 125/ HOC 267: Joy to the world	3x		Piano
VT 247: Hark the herald angels sing	3x		Clarinet, violin, trombone, organ
VT 257: Away in a manger	3x		Violin, cello, organ
VT 313: Hosanna, loud hosanna	3x		Organ, violin, guitar
VT 361/ HOC 249: Christ who left his home in glory	3x	Yes	
VT 545: Here I am Lord	3x	Yes	
VT 605/ TH 580: My life flows on	3x	Yes	
VT 606/ CH 280/ TH 51: Guide me oh thou great Jehovah	3x	Yes	
VT 653/ STJ 121: Nothing is lost on the breath of God	3x		Organ, guitar
VT 664/ CH 639/ TH 347: Be still my soul	3x		Organ
VT 4: Christ is our cornerstone	2x		Piano, organ
VT 88/ TH 8: Lobe den Herren (praise to the Lord the almighty)	2x		Organ
VT 28/ TH 49: Come Christians, join to sing	2x		Organ
VT 111: 10,000 reasons	2x		Violin, piano
VT 131: Praise, I will praise you Lord	2x		Piano
VT 137: Holy, holy, holy	2x		Trumpet, violin, piano
VT 160/ TH 354/ HOC 648: Leaning on the everlasting arms	2x		Organ

VT 218/ TH 125/ BH 178: Come thou long expected Jesus	2x	Yes	
VT 252/ TH 138: Go tell it on the mountain	2x		Organ
VT 306: I want Jesus to walk with me	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 315/ HOC 177: All glory, laud and honour	2x		Organ
VT 317/ HOC 587: Go to dark Gethsemane	2x		Organ
VT 332: In Christ alone	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 419/ TH 43/ MOP 216/ CH 100: Great is thy faithfulness	2x		Piano, cello
VT 496/ HOC 48: I owe the Lord a morning song	2x	Yes	
VT 549/ TH 382/ BH 545/ HOC 375: Be thou my vision	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 563/ TH 521/ HOC 699: Come thou fount of every blessing	2x	Yes	
VT 634: Rain, come down	2x		Piano
VT 644: Healer of our every ill	2x		Flute, piano, guitar
VT 716/ HOC 360: God of grace and God of glory	2x	Yes	
VT 718: Gentle shepherd come and lead us	2x		Piano Violin
VT 830: Go my children with my blessing	2x	Yes	
VT 9: Come away from rush and hurry			Piano, guitar
VT 22: What is this place?		Yes	
VT 25: Brethren we have met to worship		Yes	
VT 47/ HOC 81: God of our strength			Organ
VT 76/ TH 262/ TCH 29: Holy holy holy		Yes	
VT 91/ TCH 520/ TH 295: We praise thee, O God		Yes	
VT 120/ HOC 877/ TH 560: For the beauty of the Earth			Organ
VT 155: Lord I need you			Piano, guitar
VT 156: There's a wideness in God's mercy		Yes	
VT 162/ TH 67/ HOC 153: The love of God			Piano
VT 248/ HOC 221: It came upon a midnight clear			Clarinet, violin, trombone, organ
VT 249/ TH 132: Angels we have heard on high			Piano
VT 250/ TH 136: The First Noel		Yes	
VT 265/ HOC 213/ TH 131: Angels from the realms of glory		Yes	
VT 267/ HOC 227/ TH 137: What child is this			Violin, cello, piano
VT 322/ GH 225/ HOC 245: When I survey the wondrous cross		Yes	

VT 325: Oh Sacred Head now wounded		Yes	
VT 329/ HOC 247: Were you there?			Organ
VT 377: New Earth, Heavens new			Piano, guitar
VT 390: In Christ there is no East or West			Organ
VT 408/ HOC 259: Crown him with many crowns		Yes	
VT 435/ TH 345: Blessed Assurance			Organ
VT 436/ GH 111/ TH 4/ HOC 128: How great thou art		Yes	
VT 536/ CH 215: I heard the voice of Jesus say			Organ
VT 608/ HOC 514/ TH 374: Oh love that will not let me go		Yes/no	Piano, guitar
VT 610/ TH 463: Precious Lord, take my hand		Yes	
VT 617/ TH 493/ HOC 806: When peace like a river (It is well)		Yes	
VT 714/ STJ 67: Let there be light			Piano
VT 737/ HOC 609: Breathe on me breath of God		Yes	
VT 740/ TH 247: Spirit of the Living God			Piano, violin
VT 759/ CH 374/ TH 379: Take my life			Organ
VT 813: Heart with loving heart united		Yes	
VT 847: You shall go out with joy			Piano

6.9. Plains Mennonite Church

Plains also incorporated male and female leadership and musicianship. Additionally, they also use Sing the Story, Sing the Journey and Voices Together-two Mennonite hymnals and a Unitarian hymnal. Below are the results of my data collection concerning Plains (Table 15).

Table 16: Hymn Performance and Instrumentation Analysis

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
VT 11: Mountain of God	14x		Piano
VT 22: What is this place?	8x	Yes	
VT 240/ TH 125/ HOC 267: Joy to the world	8x	Yes/No	Piano
VT 389: Together	8x		Piano
VT 563/ TH 521/ HOC 699: Come thou fount of every blessing	8x		Guitar, Irish whistle

VT 241/ TH 145: Oh come all ye faithful	7x		Piano
VT 499/ STJ 45: In the morning when I rise	7x		Piano
VT 605/ TH 580: My life flows on	7x	Yes	
VT 7/ HOC 143: Come let us all unite to sing	6x		piano
VT 78/ HOC 196: Oh for a thousand tongues to sing	6x		Piano
VT 210: O come O come Immanuel	6x		Piano
VT 211: Hope is a candle	6x		Piano, guitar
VT 275: Oh beautiful star of Bethlehem	6x		Piano
VT 437: The Lord is my light	6x		Piano
VT 456: Oceans	6x		Piano, guitar
VT 832/ STJ 73: The Lord lift you up	6x		Piano, guitar
VT 29: Come now is the time to worship	5x		Guitar
VT 49: All who are thirsty	5x		Piano, guitar
VT 95: Praise the Lord, sing hallelujah	5x		Piano
VT 156: There's a wideness in God's mercy	5x		Piano
VT 160/ TH 354/ HOC 648: Leaning on the everlasting arms	5x		Piano
VT 167: Your grace is enough	5x		Piano, guitar
VT 205: Light dawns on a weary world	5x		Piano
VT 227: Here I am to worship/ich will dich anbeten	5x		Piano
VT 420/ STJ 27: God of the Bible	5x		Guitar
VT 634: Rain, come down	5x		Piano
VT 653/ STJ 121: Nothing is lost on the breath of God	5x		Piano
VT 777: Seeds	5x		Piano, guitar, drums
VT 810/ STS 57: Go my friends in grace	5x		Piano
VT 839: Go ye now in peace	5x		Piano
VT 848: Christ be all around me	5x		Piano, guitar

Below is a record of pieces that are common to five or more other churches (Table 16).

Table 17: Hymn Frequency, a Cappella Performance, and Instrumental Accompaniment

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
VT 31/ TH 18/ HOC 30: Come we that love the Lord	4x		Piano
VT 43: God be the love	4x		Piano
VT 57: Holy Spirit come with power	4x		Piano, guitar
VT 80: We sing to you O God	4x		Piano
VT 111: 10,000 reasons	4x		Guitar, piano
VT 116: How great is our God	4x		Guitar
VT 170/ TH 198/ HOC 673: The wonderful grace of Jesus	4x	Yes	
VT 218/ TH 125/ BH 178: Come thou long expected Jesus	4x		Piano
VT 248/ HOC 221: It came upon a midnight clear	4x		Piano
VT 257: Away in a manger	4x		Piano
VT 494: Gravity of love	4x		Piano, guitar
VT 555/ HOC 699/ TH 514: Lord I am fondly earnestly longing	4x		Piano
VT 626/ TH 496: A wonderful saviour is Jesus (He hideth my soul)	4x		Piano
VT 716/ HOC 360: God of grace and God of glory	4x		Piano
VT 830: Go my children with my blessing	4x		Piano
VT 1: Summoned by the God who made us	3x		Piano
VT 25: Brethren we have met to worship	3x		Piano
VT 131: Praise, I will praise you Lord	3x		Piano
VT 163/ TH 202/ HOC 676: Amazing grace	3x	Yes	
VT 182/ TH 59/ HOC 127: I sing the mighty power of God	3x	Yes/no	Piano
VT 217: Hark the glad sound!	3x	Yes/No	Piano
VT 244/ TH 147: Silent night	3x		Piano
VT 247: Hark the herald angels sing	3x		Piano
VT 267/ HOC 227/ TH 137: What child is this?	3x		Piano
VT 306: I want Jesus to walk with me	3x		Piano
VT 332: In Christ alone	3x		Piano

VT 496/ HOC 48: I owe the Lord a morning song	3x		Piano
VT 540: Will you come and follow me	3x		Piano, guitar
VT 551: Beautiful things	3x		Piano
VT 715/ STJ 54: Longing for light	3x		Piano
VT 4: Christ is our cornerstone	2x		Piano
VT 28/ TH 49: Come Christians, join to sing	2x		Piano
VT 91/ TCH 520/ TH 295: We praise thee, O God	2x		Piano
VT 120/ HOC 877/ TH 560: For the beauty of the Earth	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 123: Come ye thankful people come	2x	Yes	
VT 162/ TH 67/ HOC 153: The love of God	2x	Yes	
VT 180/ TH 58/ HOC 161: This is my father's world	2x		Piano
VT 245/ HOC 224: Oh little town of Bethlehem	2x		Piano
VT 252/ TH 138: Go tell it on the mountain	2x		Piano
VT 265/ HOC 213/ TH 131: Angels from the realms of glory	2x		Piano
VT 313: Hosanna, loud hosanna	2x		Piano
VT 315/HOC 177: All glory laud and honour	2x	Yes	
VT 317/ HOC 587: Go to dark Gethsemane	2x		Piano
VT 322/ GH 225/ HOC 245: When I survey the wondrous cross	2x		Piano
VT 329/ HOC 247: Were you there?	2x		Piano
VT 333/ TH 216/ HOC 252: Low in the grave he lay	2x		Piano
VT 340/ TH 275/ HOC 607: Lift your glad voices	2x		Piano
VT 361/ HOC 249: Christ who left his home in glory	2x		Piano
VT 364/ CH 163: All hail the power of Jesus' name	2x		Piano
VT 390: In Christ there is no East or West	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 415: Revelation song	2x		Piano
VT 419/ TH 43/ MOP 216/ CH 100: Great is thy faithfulness	2x		Piano
VT 436/ GH 111/ TH 4/ HOC 128: How great thou art	2x	Yes	

VT 549/ TH 382/ BH 545/ HOC 375: Be thou my vision	2x		Piano
VT 610/ TH 463: Precious Lord take my hand	2x		Piano
VT 617/ TH 493/ HOC 806: When peace like a river (It is well)	2x		Piano
VT 644: Healer of our every ill	2x		Piano
VT 737/ HOC 609: Breathe on me breath of God	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 813: Heart with loving heart united	2x		Piano
VT 830: Go my children	2x		Piano
VT 846: The Lord bless you and keep you	2x		Piano
VT 847: You shall go out with joy	2x		Piano
Goodness of God			Piano, guitar
How deep the father's love for us			Piano, guitar
Sing praise to God		Yes	
This is amazing grace			Guitar, piano
What a beautiful name			Piano
VT 4/ TH 404: Cornerstone			Piano, guitar
VT 9: Come away from rush and hurry			Piano
VT 10: Here in this place		Yes	
VT 47/ HOC 81: God of our strength			Piano
VT 70/ 71: Praise God from whom all blessings flow			Piano, guitar
VT 74/ HOC 6/TH 10: O worship the king			Piano
VT 76/ TCH 29/ TH 262: Holy holy holy			Piano
VT 84/ TH 66/ MOP 40/ HOC 76: To God be the glory			Piano
VT 88/ TH 8: Praise to the Lord the almighty			Piano
VT 98/ HOC 107: Immortal invisible			Piano
VT 122: Sing to the God of harvest			Piano
VT 125: Shout to the Lord			Piano, guitar
VT 133/ HOC 557/ TH 364: My Jesus I love thee		Yes	
VT 155: Lord I need you			Piano
VT 162/ TH 67/ HOC 153: The love of God			Piano

VT 178: God of wonders		Yes	
VT 223: Bless'd be the God of Israel			Piano
VT 249/ TH 132: Angels we have heard on high			Piano
VT 259/ HOC 220: To us a child of hope is born			Piano
VT 369: There's nothing worth more			Piano, guitar
VT 377: New Earth, Heavens new			Piano, guitar
VT 387/ TH 284: We are one in the Spirit		Yes	
VT 401: Open the eyes of my heart Lord			Piano
VT 435/ TH 345: Blessed assurance			Piano
VT 443/ CH 729: I have decided to follow Jesus			Piano
VT 536/ CH 215: I heard the voice of Jesus say			Piano
VT 545: Here I am Lord			Piano
VT 570: When we walk with the Lord		Yes	
VT 592/ TH 275: How firm a foundation			Piano
VT 597: My lighthouse			Piano, guitar
VT 606/ CH 280/ TH 51: Guide me oh thou great Jehovah		Yes	
VT 608/ HOC 514/ TH 374: Oh love that will not let me go		Yes	
VT 628/ HOC 652/ TH 435: What a friend we have in Jesus			Piano
VT 640/ HOC 172: My shepherd will supply my need			Piano
VT 714/ STJ 67: Let there be light		Yes	
VT 759/ CH 374/ TH 379: Take my life			Piano, guitar
VT 812: Sent forth by God's blessing		Yes	

6.10. Salford Mennonite Church

Salford also use male and female musicians, as well as male and female leadership, and the hymnals used by Salford are Hymnal: A Worship Book, Sing the Story, Sing the Journey and Voices Together-one Brethren hymnal, one Unitarian hymnal and two Mennonite hymnals. Below are the results of my data collection concerning Salford (Table 17).

Table 18: Frequently Performed Hymns and Their Musical Accompaniment

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
VT 813: Heart with loving heart united	13x	Yes	
VT 10: Here in this place	9x	Yes	
VT 42: Could it be that God is singing?	9x		Piano
Jesus calls us here to meet him	8x		Piano
VT 22: What is this place?	8x	Yes	
VT 210: O come, o come Immanuel	8x	Yes	
VT 810/ STS 57: Go my friends in grace	8x	Yes/No	Piano
VT 57: Holy Spirit come with power	7x	Yes	
VT 91/ TCH 520/ TH 295: We praise thee, O God (revive us again)	7x	Yes	
VT 389: Together	7x		Guitar
VT 540: Will you come and follow me?	7x		Piano
VT 563/ TH 521/ HOC 699: Come thou fount of every blessing	7x		Piano
VT 636: Spirit open my heart	7x		Piano
VT 809: Sing a new world into being	7x	Yes	
VT 844: May the face of God shine on you	7x	Yes/No	Piano
VT 1: Summoned by the God who made us	6x	Yes	
VT 62: God is here among us	6x	Yes	
VT 120/ HOC 877/ TH 560: For the beauty of the Earth	6x	Yes	
VT 147: Kyrie Eleison	6x		Piano, guitar
VT 240/ TH 125/ HOC 267: Joy to the world	6x	No/Yes	Piano
VT 536/ CH 215: I heard the voice of Jesus say	6x	Yes	
VT 716/ HOC 360: God of grace and God of glory	6x	Yes	

VT 777: Seeds	6x		Piano
VT 28: Come Christians join to sing	5x	Yes	
VT 47/ HOC 81: God of our strength	5x	Yes	
VT 88 TH 8: Praise to the Lord the almighty	5x	Yes	
VT 98/ HOC 107: Immortal invisible	5x	Yes	
VT 212: Comfort comfort oh my people	5x	Yes	
VT 217/ HOC 201: Hark the glad sound	5x	Yes	
VT 276: Solemn stillness, weary streets	5x		Piano
VT 329/ HOC 247: Were you there?	5x		Guitar
VT 353: Now the green blade riseth	5x	Yes	
VT 797: We are people of God's peace	5x	Yes	
VT 849: We your people sing your praises	5x		Piano, guitar

Below is a record of pieces that are common to five or more other churches (Table 18).

Table 19: Hymn Performance Frequency, a Cappella Singing, and Instrumental Accompaniment

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
VT 7/ HOC 143: Come let us all unite to sing	4x		Piano
VT 31/ TH 18/ HOC 30: Come we that love the Lord	4x	Yes	
VT 78/HOC 196: Oh for a thousand tongues to sing	4x	Yes	
VT 156: There's a wideness in God's mercy	4x	Yes	
VT 182/ TH 59/ HOC 127: I sing the mighty power of God	4x	Yes	
VT 245/ HOC 224: Oh little town of Bethlehem	4x	Yes	
VT 247: Hark the herald angels sing	4x	Yes	
VT 275: Oh beautiful star of Bethlehem	4x	Yes	
VT 390: In Christ there is no East or West	4x	Yes	
VT 549/ TH 382/ BH 545/ HOC 375: Be thou my vision	4x	Yes	
VT 640/ HOC 172: My shepherd will supply my need	4x	Yes	

VT 653/ STJ 121: Nothing is lost on the breath of God	4x	Yes	
VT 844: May the face of God shine on you	4x		Piano
VT 218/ TH 125/ BH 178: Come thou long expected Jesus	3x	Yes/No	Guitar
VT 223: Bless'd be the God of Israel	3x	Yes	
VT 241/ TH 145: Oh come all ye faithful	3x	Yes	
VT 248/ HOC 221: It came upon a Midnight clear	3x	Yes	
VT 249/ TH 132: Angels we have heard on high	3x		Guitar, piano
VT 252/ TH 138: Go tell it on the mountain	3x		Piano
VT 257: Away in a manger	3x	Yes	
VT 259/ HOC 220: To us a child of hope is born	3x	Yes	
VT 306: I want Jesus to walk with me	3x		Guitar
VT 377: New Earth, Heavens new	3x		Piano
VT 443/ CH 729: I have decided to follow Jesus	3x	Yes	
VT 496/ HOC 48: I owe the Lord a morning song	3x	Yes	
VT 551: Beautiful things	3x		Guitar, piano
VT 605/ TH 580: My life flows on	3x	Yes	
VT 715/ STJ 54: Longing for light	3x		Piano
VT 846: The Lord Bless you and keep you	3x	Yes	
VT 847: You shall go out with joy	3x	Yes	
VT 847: You shall go out with joy	3x	Yes	
VT 9: Come away from rush and hurry	2x		Piano
VT 162/ TH 67/ HOC 153: The love of God	2x	Yes	
VT 163/ TH 202/ HOC 676: Amazing grace	2x		Piano
VT 244/ TH 147: Silent night	2x	Yes	
VT 250/ TH 136: The First Noel	2x		Piano, guitar
VT 267/ HOC 227/ TH 137: What child is this?	2x	Yes	
VT 313: Hosanna, loud hosanna	2x	Yes	
VT 315/ HOC 177: All glory laud and honour	2x		Piano

VT 317/ HOC 587: Go to dark Gethsemane	2x		Piano
VT 332: In Christ alone	2x		Piano
VT 333/ TH 216/ HOC 252: Low in the grave he lay	2x	Yes	
VT 340/ TH 275/ HOC 607: Lift your glad voices	2x	Yes	
VT 361/ HOC 249: Christ who left his home in glory	2x	Yes	
VT 364/ CH 163: All hail the power of Jesus name	2x	Yes	
VT 387/ TH 284: We are one in the Spirit	2x		Piano
VT 419/ TH 43/ MOP 216/ CH 100: Great is thy faithfulness	2x	Yes	
VT 606/ CH 280/ TH 51: Guide me oh thou great Jehovah	2x	Yes	
VT 634: Rain, come down	2x		Piano
VT 714/ STJ 67: Let there be light	2x	Yes	
VT 737/ HOC 609: Breathe on me breath of God	2x		Piano
VT 832/ STJ 73: The Lord lift you up	2x		Piano
How deep the father's love for us			Ukelele
VT 4/ TH 404: Cornerstone		Yes	
VT 11: Mountain of God			Guitar
VT 25: Brethren we have met to worship		Yes	
VT 84/ TH 66/ MOP 40/ HOC 76: To God be the glory		Yes	
VT 92: Build my life			Piano
VT 101: Sing praise to God		Yes	
VT 103/ TH 1: Joyful joyful		Yes	
VT 122: Sing to the God of harvest			Piano
VT 131: Praise I will praise you lord		Yes	
VT 170/ HOC 673/ TH 198: Wonderful grace of Jesus		Yes	
VT 178: God of Wonders			Piano
VT 180/ TH 58/ HOC 161: This is my father's world		Yes	
VT 265/ HOC 213/ TH 131: Angels from the realms of glory		Yes	
VT 325: Oh sacred head now wounded		Yes	

VT 401: Open the eyes of my heart Lord			Piano
VT 420/ STJ 27: God of the Bible			Ukelele
VT 436/ GH 111/ TH 4/ HOC 128: How great thou art		Yes	
VT 456: Oceans			Guitar, piano
VT 502/ TH 419/ HOC 644: Abide with me		Yes	
VT 545: Here I am Lord		Yes	
VT 570: When we walk with the Lord		Yes	
VT 592/ TH 275: How firm a foundation		Yes	
VT 597: My lighthouse			Guitar
VT 617/ TH 493/ HOC 806: When peace like a river (It is well)			Guitar
VT 626/ TH 496: A wonderful saviour is Jesus (He hideth my soul)			Piano
VT 644: Healer of our every ill			Piano
VT 664/ TH 347/ CH 639: Be still my soul			Piano
VT 740/ TH 247: Spirit of the living God		Yes	
VT 759/ CH 374/ TH 379: Take my life		Yes	
VT 812: Sent forth by God's blessing		Yes	
VT 830: Go my children with my blessing		Yes	

6.11. Steinmann Mennonite Church

Steinmann are continuing the trend having male and female leadership and musicians. However they only use one hymnal-voices together-purely a Mennonite musical influence. Below are the results of my data collection concerning Steinmann (Table 19).

Table 20: Hymn Performance Frequency and Instrumentation

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
VT 634: Rain, come down	7x		Guitar, piano

Below is a record of pieces that are common to five or more other churches (Table 20).

Table 21: Hymn Performance Frequency and Instrumental Accompaniment

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
VT 7/ HOC 143: Come let us all unite to sing	4x		Piano
VT 57: Holy Spirit come with power	4x		Piano
VT 120/ HOC 877/ TH 560: For the beauty of the earth	4x		French horn, tuba, flute, trumpet, violin, piano
VT 606/ CH 280/ TH 51: Guide me oh thou great Jehovah	4x		Piano
VT 830: Go my Children with my blessing	4x		Guitar, Violin
VT 91/ TCH 520/ TH 295: We praise thee O God	3x		Piano
VT 223: Bless'd be the God of Israel	3x		Guitar, violin, piano
VT 227: Here I am to worship	3x		Piano, guitar, French horn
VT 240/ TH 125/ HOC 267: Joy to the world	3x		Organ, trumpet
VT 536/ CH 215: I heard the voice of Jesus say	3x		Piano
VT 551: Beautiful things	3x		Organ
VT 832/ STJ 73: The Lord lift you up	3x		Piano
VT 9: Come away from rush and hurry	2x		Piano
VT 49: All who are thirsty	2x	Yes	
VT 70/71: Praise God from whom all blessings flow	2x	Yes	
VT 76/ TH 262/ TCH 29: Holy holy holy	2x		Piano, organ
VT 111: 10,000 reasons	2x		Piano
VT 131: Praise, I will praise you Lord	2x		Piano
VT 218/ TH 125/ BH 178: Come thou long expected Jesus	2x		Guitar, violin
VT 377: New Earth, Heavens new	2x		Piano
VT 436/ GH 111/ TH 4/ HOC 128: How great thou art	2x		Piano
VT 549/ TH 382/ BH 545/ HOC 375: Be thou my vision	2x		Organ

VT 7/ HOC 143: Come let us all unite to sing	4x		Piano
VT 57: Holy Spirit come with power	4x		Piano
VT 120/ HOC 877/ TH 560: For the beauty of the earth	4x		French horn, tuba, flute, trumpet, violin, piano
VT 606/ CH 280/ TH 51: Guide me oh thou great Jehovah	4x		Piano
VT 830: Go my Children with my blessing	4x		Guitar, Violin
VT 91/ TCH 520/ TH 295: We praise thee O God	3x		Piano
VT 223: Bless'd be the God of Israel	3x		Guitar, violin, piano
VT 227: Here I am to worship	3x		Piano, guitar, French horn
VT 240/ TH 125/ HOC 267: Joy to the world	3x		Organ, trumpet
VT 536/ CH 215: I heard the voice of Jesus say	3x		Piano
VT 551: Beautiful things	3x		Organ
VT 832/ STJ 73: The Lord lift you up	3x		Piano
VT 9: Come away from rush and hurry	2x		Piano
VT 49: All who are thirsty	2x	Yes	
VT 70/71: Praise God from whom all blessings flow	2x	Yes	
VT 76/ TH 262/ TCH 29: Holy holy holy	2x		Piano, organ
VT 111: 10,000 reasons	2x		Piano
VT 131: Praise, I will praise you Lord	2x		Piano
VT 218/ TH 125/ BH 178: Come thou long expected Jesus	2x		Guitar, violin
VT 218/ TH 125/ BH 178: Come thou long expected Jesus	2x		Guitar, violin
VT 377: New Earth, Heavens new	2x		Piano

VT 218/ TH 125/ BH 178: Come thou long expected Jesus	2x		Guitar, violin
VT 377: New Earth, Heavens new	2x		Piano
VT 436/ GH 111/ TH 4/ HOC 128: How great thou art	2x		Piano
VT 549/ TH 382/ BH 545/ HOC 375: Be thou my vision	2x		Organ
VT 555/ TH 514/ HOC 699: Lord I am fondly, earnestly longing	2x	Yes	
VT 570: When we walk with the Lord	2x		Piano
VT 640/ HOC 172: My shepherd will supply my need	2x		Piano
VT 644: Healer of our every ill	2x		Organ
VT 812: Sent forth by God's blessing	2x		Piano, guitar
My Jesus I love thee			Piano
VT 1: Summoned by the God who made us			Piano
VT 4/ TH 404: Cornerstone			Piano
VT 47/ HOC 81: God of our strength			Piano
VT 88/ TH 8: Praise to the Lord the Almighty			Piano
VT 10: Here in this place			Piano
VT 116: How great is our God			Violin, Guitar, Drums
VT 122: Sing to the God of harvest			Piano
VT 123: Come ye thankful people come		Yes	
VT 133/ HOC 557/ TH 364: My Jesus I love thee		Yes	
VT 155: Lord I need you			Piano, Drums, Violin
VT 156: There's a wideness in God's mercy			Piano, guitar
VT 170/ HOC 673/ TH 198: Wonderful grace of Jesus			Piano
VT 241/ TH 145: Oh come all ye faithful			Piano
VT 247: Hark the herald angels sing			Piano
VT 265/ HOC 213/ TH 131: Angels from the realms of glory			Piano
VT 275: Beautiful Star of Bethlehem			Piano

VT 306: I want Jesus to walk with me			Piano
VT 317/ HOC 587: Go to dark Gethsemane			Organ
VT 332: In Christ alone			Cello, guitar
VT 361/ HOC 249: Christ who left his home in glory			Piano
VT 401: Open the eyes of my heart Lord			Ukelele
VT 420/ STJ 27: God of the Bible			Piano, guitar
VT 435/ TH 345: Blessed Assurance			Piano
VT 496/ HOC 48: I owe the Lord a morning song			Organ
VT 502/ TH 419/ HOC 644: Abide with me			Organ
VT 540: Will you come and follow me		Yes	
VT 563/ TH 521/ HOC 699: Come thou fount of every blessing			Piano
VT 597: My lighthouse			Piano
VT 610/ TH 463: Precious Lord, take my hand			Piano, guitar
VT 617/ TH 493/ HOC 806: When peace like a river (It is well)			Piano
VT 626/ TH 496: A wonderful saviour is Jesus (He hideth my soul)			Piano
VT 653/ STJ 121: Nothing is lost on the breath of God			Organ
VT 715/ STJ 54: Longing for light			Piano
VT 759/ CH 374/ TH 379: Take my life			Piano, guitar
VT 839: Go ye now in peace			Organ

6.12. Trinity Mennonite Church

Trinity was the most intriguing church, as they are an amalgamation of churches-they have male and female musicians, but male leadership. However Trinity Mennonite Church seem to be caught between the old and new ways of doing church-they use voices together-a hymnal with traditional songs, but none of these songs feature on the list of top songs, demonstrating another contradiction-they use a traditional hymnal, yet contemporary Christian praise and worship songs are the most popular when analysed. Below are the results of my data collection concerning Trinity (Table 21).

Table 22: Hymn Performance Frequency and Instrumental Accompaniment

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
My feet are on the rock	7x		Guitar, ukelele
Do it again	6x		Guitar
There's nothing worth more	5x		Guitar

Table 23: Hymn Performance Frequency, a Cappella Singing, and Instrumental Accompaniment

Hymn	Frequency	A Capella ?	Instrument (s)
Christ is risen	4x		Guitar
Come let us all unite to sing	4x	Yes	
Cornerstone	4x		Guitar, piano
Death was arrested	4x		Guitar
No longer slaves	4x		Guitar, piano
The God of all languages	4x		Guitar
Beautiful things	3x		Guitar, piano
Come thou fount of every blessing	3x		Piano
In Christ alone	3x		Piano, guitar
My lighthouse	3x		Guitar
Oceans	3x		Guitar
Summoned by the God who made us	3x		Guitar
Be thou my vision	2x		Guitar
Build my life	2x		Guitar, piano
Christ is our cornerstone	2x		Guitar, piano
Holy Spirit come with power	2x	Yes	

I owe the Lord a morning song	2x	Yes	
10,000 reasons			Piano
God of grace and God of glory		Yes	
God of our strength		Yes	
Great is thy faithfulness			Guitar
Here I am Lord			Piano
Holy holy holy			Piano, guitar
How firm a foundation			Guitar
I have decided to follow Jesus			Piano, guitar
Jesus Messiah			Guitar, piano
Joy to the world			Piano
Joyful joyful			Piano
Lift your glad voices		Yes	
Longing for light			Violin, guitar
My hope is built on nothing less			Piano
My shepherd will supply my need			Piano, guitar
Noel			Piano, guitar
Oh come all ye faithful		Yes	
Praise God from whom all blessings flow		Yes	
Praise, I will praise you Lord			Guitar
Praise, I will praise you Lord		Yes	
Take my life		Yes	
The Lord bless you and keep you			Guitar, piano
This is amazing grace			Piano, guitar
To God be the glory		Yes	
What child is this?			Guitar, drums

When peace like a river (It is well)		Yes	
Wonderful grace of Jesus		Yes	
You are holy			Violin, piano, guitar
You shall go out with joy			Piano, guitar

6.13. Why did they Need a New Hymnal?

Since the publication of the first Anabaptist hymnal-the Ausbund in 1564, to the Mennonite Hymnal in 1969, Mennonite musicology and hymnology has been on a long journey (Table 22). However this journey has not been straightforward as Berg states. Any new hymnal(s) finds itself on the ‘...border between past and future they have to preserve the musical heritage of the past and they have to present congregations with musical materials relevant to the present and try to peer into the future to provide musical and theological materials that will last...’ Any new hymnal(s) pushes people beyond complacency and becoming too comfortable with core songs and with their theology [38]. I would argue that Mennonite hymnody shapes Mennonite theology, becoming the most important form of expression and though hymn-singing is seen as the most Mennonite of musical activities in many ways. However, I would argue that there should not be an over-reliance on familiar songs just because they have their heart songs. I would argue that stereotypes concerning “acceptable” church music should be abandoned to learn new songs, accept a new musical resource, and to become active participants in the wider global Christian church-one of the intentions behind the publication of the new hymnal Voices Together [39]. When compiling Voices Together, Graber and Thiessen stated that efforts were made to ‘...expand shared understandings of Mennonite music...’ and the committee in charge of assembling the hymnal for Mennonite Church Canada and Mennonite Church USA congregations needed to, ‘...consider both who it would resource and who it would represent...’ [40]. Commonly, Mennonite denominations publish an updated hymnal every 20 to 30 years. As such Voices Together (2020) was published 28 years after Hymnal: A Worship Book (1992). Additionally, there were two very well-received supplements entitled Sing the Journey (2005) and Sing the Story (2007), which were part of the groundwork for Voices Together, and about half of the new hymnal is drawn from these three volumes showing why the contents of Voices Together is the most common in the churches I assessed. Dr Ben Bergey stated that creating voices together for the Mennonite Church USA

and Mennonite Church Canada was a four-year process [41]. The committee, who consisted of current authors, as well as ‘...other music scholars, musicians, pastors, theologians, and songwriters...’ spent the first year just listening to the wider church and their most treasured songs. In 2022, this consisted of congregations from ‘...59 countries, with a total of 1.45 million baptized believers...’ through surveys, conferences, visits and meetings [42]. They examined ‘...tens of thousands of worship resources and songs with the help of thousands of Google docs spreadsheets, countless zoom meetings and then a full two months of in person meetings [43]. However, conversations were needed concerning the origins of songs and who wrote them [44]. Further, what amount of songs should be taken from previous hymnals? ‘How many should come from Reformation era writers and before [45]. As a result of these conversations, it was decided that, due to the 20 plus spoken languages being used in North American Mennonite worship, when the committee was compiling the collection, they wanted to keep old and new styles, ‘...sought to preserve beloved old and new styles and to introduce new-to-mennonite songs that would feed the musical and theological needs and desires of the denominations [46]. To shape voices together, the committee paid attention to some of the oldest songs and prayers in Christianity-perhaps suggesting why the Our Father has become so much more popular? There was also the inclusion of ‘...material that is post-scriptural and from before approximately 1500 when the various sixteenth-century reformations began’ [47]. I would argue that the inclusion of pre-reformation material was intended to identify gaps and then to fill these gaps. However, whilst this inclusion of material was beneficial, the problem still remained of accessibility to this material [48]. Therefore, to aid in this, pre-Reformation material was paired with ‘...new tunes that can make them more singable for congregations...’ and this idea of new tunes being introduced is important. Despite the committee deciding that the repertoire should comprise of 50% new material new to mennonites, the “new” material originated from previous hymnals. This may not seem like any sort of progression; however this is in line with how Mennonite hymnals have been created in the past. ‘...The finished collection includes 759 songs, 467 (about 60%) of which have at least one component from...’ The Mennonite Hymnal (1969), Hymnal: A Worship Book (1992), or Sing the Journey (2005) and Sing the Story (2007) [49]. Despite Voices Together being a Mennonite hymnal, the use of hymnals from other denominations should not be surprising, as Berg stated that it is only the Old Order Amish and Hutterian Brethren that sing hymns solely unique to their traditions. ‘Most

Mennonites sing hymns borrowed from other denominations...’ [50]. As a result, there are 28 texts from authors such as Isaac Watts, Charles Wesley and Catherine Winkworth. However, there is also more material from early Anabaptist authors such as Menno Simons, Felix Manx and Christopher Dock, along with early Anabaptist texts such as the Ausbund. Voices Together has increased the number, to include more “modern” pieces from Mennonite composers and authors [51]. Particularly concerning Anabaptist contributions, ‘...one hundred and eighty-three of the musical selections in Voices Together have elements of text or tune contributed by an Anabaptist...’ almost double the amount in Hymnal: A Worship Book. After all deliberations, and when Voices Together was finally compiled, 94 texts and tunes came from Sing the Journey and Sing the Story. Only 17 texts or tunes came from the Mennonite hymnal but 292 pieces were new to Voices Together, such as ecumenical hymnals and newly written pieces et cetera. However, the majority of texts and tunes 293 came from Hymnal: A Worship Book, highlighting its importance and influence over Mennonite hymnody, asking the question of if this text had not been created, where would Mennonite music be today? There was a further question the committee considered: what languages should be represented in the new hymnal? For the first 50 years of Mennonite worship gatherings, the hymn books for the ‘...Mennonite World Conference gatherings, developed by Europeans or North Americans only included music from the Euro-American canon [52]. The first Mennonite world conference songbook also only included European/Euro-American music. The first representation of global music was found in the 1978 collection (Table 23). Since then, Mennonite World Conference songbooks have all included songs from around the world’ [53]. This is seen particularly in Voices Together, which aspired to show ‘...the linguistic and cultural diversity of the church...’ with its inclusion of worship resources ‘...from six continents, and in Spanish, French, German, and American Sign Language...’ There was also a massive increase in worship songs that featured Spanish. It rose from 8 in Hymnal: A Worship Book, to 49 in Voices Together. In total, 50 languages other than English ‘...appear in the hymnal among songs and worship resources...’ and I have included a breakdown of languages represented.

Table 24: Frequency Distribution of Hymns by Language

Language	Frequency	Language	Frequency
English	740	Shona	2
Spanish	49	Urdu	2

German	23	Cantonese	1
Swahili	17	Catalan	1
French	13	Chin	1
Latin	13	Dakota	1
Greek	8	Dutch	1
Arabic	7	Filipino	1
Hebrew	5	Guarani	1
Korean	4	Hmong	1
Xhosa	4	Khmer	1
Zulu	4	Kiowa	1
American Sign Language	3	Marathi	1
Cheyenne	3	Muscogee	1
Indonesian	3	Norwegian	1
Mandarin	3	Sotho	1
Japanese	2	Telegu	1
Lao	2	Thai	1
Lingala	2	Tonga	1
Navajo	2	Tshiluba	1
Portugese	2	Twi	1

However, there was yet another focus-the gender distribution of hymns and their tunes throughout Voices Together, as there are oftentimes many ‘...barriers in hymnal publishing faced by composers and text writers based on gender, race/ethnicity, and geographic location...’ The committee also realised that if female worshippers could not see female authors in a hymnal, hymn writing could be considered a ‘...male activity, not for them...’ To combat this, the committee addressed the gender of the text writers and composers and made a significant effort to include more hymns from female authors. This resulted in just over 27% of sung texts and nearly 19% of tunes in Voices Together ‘...being written by women, almost double the number than the previous collection, Hymnal: A Worship Book In this collection, only ‘...11.3% of text writers were women, 66.3% were men, with 22.4% unattributed...’ Concerning female tune authors, it is lower still at only 6.5% showing that women were more likely to write texts than tunes. I argue that the reason for this is due to the female activity of writing texts for hymns as some sort of devotional exercise, suggesting why the number of female text contributors in the Mennonite song collection(s) of 1992 is higher. It is, however, fascinating to me that even though women can be ordained in the Mennonite church, the amount of women represented in the hymnal is still lacking, despite almost doubling the number of Hymnal: A Worship Book. Perhaps there still is little gender diversity in previous hymnals, despite the

committee’s best efforts, as for Voices Together to have the same amount of hymns written by women as written by men, almost every new song would have to have been written by a woman. Nevertheless, there was a focus on ‘...increasing the representation of women...’ and these actions were taken in an attempt to move towards constructing ‘...an understanding of women as created in the image of God and as creators of the song of the church...’ In Voices Together, the committee raised the number of female text writers to 21%, 57% being from men, and 21% unattributed. However, 12% of the tune writers are women, 59-60% are men, 27% are unattributed and 0.1% are genderqueer about 1 hymn in the collection. The importance of female contributors also stops the effect of men deciding what is canon and what is not (Table 24).

7. Conclusion

When examining Mennonite musical resources, it has become clear to me that their musical identity has adapted and continues to adapt to their social context through the publication of numerous hymnals from the Ausbund to Voices Together. Whilst it is clear how the Ausbund has affected Mennonite musicology-providing the groundwork for future hymnals and putting the Anabaptists on the musical map, I would argue that the effect Voices Together will have on the church and the faith remains to be seen. It does what every previous hymnal has done-building on what came before with an extensive repertoire, whilst also giving credence to what could come in the future, such as with contemporary Christian songs. However, it is not just their musical tastes that define them. Mennonite congregations are distinguished and set apart by enormous diversity in theology and praxis-something that is reflected in voices together. As the committee explained, it is their hope that every congregation finds elements that will challenge and expand their view(s). However, whilst this is the aim, there is no doubt that within any Mennonite hymnal of the past, or the future, not everything will work for every congregation in terms of their theology or their music, and this is to be expected. By collating and holding the diversity of the Mennonite Church in one resource, it still allows them to connect with one another, pass down songs and stories, and help them to grow into new ways of doing and being church together.

Conflict of Interest Statement: The author states that there is no conflict of interest in terms of this research, the analysis, or the preparation of this article for publication.

Funding Information: This research was not in receipt of specific external funding.

Data Availability Statement: Any data analysed in this study was gained from publicly available online worship services from the ten Mennonite churches, alongside published hymnological and historical sources which are referenced within this article. This study spanned 1,538 online services from 2020 to 2023 and recorded hymn frequency, vocal performance and instrumental accompaniment. The foundational spreadsheet for this research is not yet in a public repository. The author may be contacted on reasonable request for any further information about the data.

Ethical Approval Statement: This study analysed publicly available online worship services. No experiments were undertaken with human participants, and this study was purely observational. If individual experience(s) or comment(s) are referenced, they are only in the necessary context for discourse surrounding Mennonite musicology. No identifying, personal or sensitive information is reported.

Acknowledgement: I would like to thank the ten Mennonite communities who made their worship services public to help make this research feasible. I would also like to acknowledge all of the individuals who have written on Mennonite hymnology, worship, history and theology that formed the backbone of this study. I am equally grateful to those who are continuing to contribute to Mennonite scholarship concerning music, and who are dedicated to preserving and protecting its long heritage.

References

- Voices Together MennoMedia. 2020, 243
- Darryl Neustaedter Barg, Toward Multiple Musical Languages in Worship, 23.1 Vision: A Journal for Church and Theology. 2022, 64
- Barg (n 2) 64
- Hymnals: Old, New, and Sometimes Gathering Dust, Anabaptist World. 2024
- Wesley Berg, Gesangbuch, Ziffern, Deutschtum: A Study of the Life and Work of J P Claszen, Mennonite Hymnologist, 8 Journal of Mennonite Studies. 1986, 21
- Berg (n 6) 16
- Berg (n 6) 17
- Laura Jean Pauls, Making Room for Difference: Identity Reconstruction in a Mennonite Church (Master's thesis, 2007) 73–74
- Berg (n 6) 24–25
- Wesley Berg, From Piety to Sophistication: Developments in Canadian-Mennonite Music after World War II 9 Journal of Mennonite Studies. 1988, 92
- Pauls (n 8) 72–73
- Berg (n 12) 93
- Hymnals: Old, New, and Sometimes Gathering Dust (n 4)
- Katie Graber, Congregational Song: The Power to Heal, the Power to Hurt 22.1 Vision: A Journal for Church and Theology, 2021, 71
- Barg (n 2) 65
- Berg (n 12) 95–96
- Rebecca Slough, What Shall We Sing? 13.1 Vision: A Journal for Church and Theology. 2012, 28
- David Jefferson Tant, To Play or Not to Play that is the Question. 2015, 6
- Tant (n 20) 11
- Tant (n 20) 9–10
- Tant (n 20) 12
- Tant (n 20) 13
- Beverly Lapp, Three Mennonite Worship Spaces 23.1 Vision: A Journal for Church and Theology. 2022, 51
- Lapp (n 27) 54
- Audrey Elizabeth Thomas and others, A Little More Swinging and Upbeat: The Music Traditions of the Boone Mennonite Brethren Church (doctoral dissertation, Appalachian State University). 2015, 21
- Adam M L Tice, Sound Faith: Mennonite Hymnals and Identity 23.1 Vision: A Journal for Church and Theology. 2022, 16
- Tice (n 31) 15
- Tice (n 31) 17
- Marilyn Houser Hamm, Singing Our Salvation 14.1 Vision: A Journal for Church and Theology. 2013, 55
- Jonathan Dueck, Worship Wars, World Music, and Menno-Nots: Recent Studies in Mennonite Music 23 Journal of Mennonite Studies. 2005, 124
- Dueck (n 35) 130
- Clarence Hiebert, The Making of a New Mennonite Brethren Hymnal 22 Direction. 1993, 11
- Werner De Jong, 'The Journey of Reconciliation at Holyrood Mennonite Church' 19.2 Visions: A Journal for Church and Theology. 2018, 67
- Dueck (n 35) 128
- Katie Graber and Anneli Loepp Thiessen, Publishing Privileges the Published: An Analysis of

- Gender, Class, and Race in the Hymnological Feedback Loop, 14 Religions. 2023, 1273, 3
36. Tice (n 31) 19
37. Voices Together Q&A on the New Mennonite Hymnal, Pray Tell (2 February 2024)
38. Graber and Thiessen (n 40) 1
39. Graber and Thiessen (n 40) 3
40. Ben Bergey, HMC Voices Together Dedication Service. 2020
41. Graber (n 16) 73
42. Graber and Thiessen (n 40) 1
43. Carl Bear and Sarah Kathleen Johnson, Singing with the Early and Medieval Church through Voices Together, Vision: A Journal for Church and Theology. 2022, 23(1):75
44. Bear and Johnson (n 49) 77
45. Graber and Thiessen (n 40) 3
46. Berg (n 12) 91
47. Tice (n 31) 20
48. Graber and Thiessen (n 40) 3
49. Voices Together Q&A on the New Mennonite Hymnal (n 42)
50. Graber and Thiessen (n 40) 2
51. Graber (n 16) 73
52. Sarah Kathleen Johnson, The Problem of Mennonite Worship Leadership Becoming Women's Work, Vision: A Journal for Church and Theology. 2022, 23(1):25
53. Graber and Thiessen (n 40) 6